



Adrianus Inu N <adrianus@fmipa.unmul.ac.id>

Second Pre-review Result ID 464

Indonesian Physical Review <ipr.journal@unram.ac.id>
To: adrianus@fmipa.unmul.ac.id, sripurw4@yahoo.co.id

Mon, Jan 20, 2025 at 1:33 PM

Reff#:464

Refining the Formulation of Geometric Optics as an Abelian $U(1)$ Gauge Theory: Addressing Conceptual Inaccuracies and Enhancing Predictive Accuracy
by Adrianus Inu Natalisanto and Sri Purwaningsih

Dear Adrianus Inu Natalisanto, *et al.*,

We have reported for a pre-review.

I've included comments from the reports below.

These comments suggest that the submission cannot fit our publication requirement.

Please revise your manuscript and upload it to the system if you still consider published with us.

Yours sincerely,

Editorial Team

Indonesian Physical ReviewEmail: ipr.journal@unram.ac.id<https://ipr.unram.ac.id/index.php/ipr/>

Report of the second pre-review-ID-464

Editor comment:

We appreciate the effort you have put into addressing the initial feedback. However, after thorough evaluation, we find that the revised manuscript still requires significant revisions to meet the standards for publication. While your attempt to refine the formulation and challenge a previous publication is valuable, the way the proposed corrections are presented is not yet aligned with the expectations for a new scientific contribution. Specifically, the manuscript remains overly focused on mathematical derivations without sufficient discussion of the physical implications, practical relevance, or comparative analysis with experimental findings or clear simulation. As a result, the revisions have not yet achieved the clarity, depth, and broader applicability needed to justify publication as a standalone article. We encourage you to revise further, incorporating the detailed feedback provided, and resubmit for consideration.

Additional comment:

1. Similarity result: 21%. Please ensure the similarity is less than 15%.
 2. See attachment for criticism.
-

2 attachments**464 Similarity Submission.pdf**

1392K

**464 Second pre-review.docx**

128K