e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

# THE MUMBAI TERRORIST ATTACKS IN *HOTEL MUMBAI* FILM: A NEW HISTORICISM STUDY

Rattania Dwi Hutami<sup>1,\*</sup>, Fatimah M.<sup>2</sup>, & Jonathan Irene Sartika Dewi Max<sup>3</sup>

English Department, Faculty of Cultural Sciences
Mulawarman University
Email: rattaniadwih@gmail.com

### **ABSTRACT**

This study attempts to analyze the portrayal of the Mumbai attacks and the contradiction points in the *Hotel Mumbai* film. This film is made based on the true events of the Mumbai terrorist attacks in 2008. Related to these huge events, there are a lot of historical books that have covered the Mumbai terrorist attacks. The study aims to find the contradictive representation of the film based on the official history. This research was conducted by using a descriptive method and qualitative approach. In this research, the researcher took data from conversations of characters and the framing of mise-en-scene in the film. This study is conducted by applying a new historicism approach and intrinsic elements of literature, the researcher compares the official history and the film. Through the new historicism approach, the researcher discovers that the *Hotel Mumbai* film places a lot of differences. First, there is a difference regarding the characters positioning. Second, there is a difference in the narrative structure of Zahra – Seyfi & Meltem. Third, there is a very clear difference between the setting of place and time. Lastly, this film has picked up the narrative elements to show what has not been known by the public only by reading the official version of history. The goal is to show that a historical-based film can be aimed to gain equal representation of historical narratives from a different point of view.

**Keywords:** New Historicism, Terrorist, *Hotel Mumbai*, Mumbai Attacks.

### **ABSTRAK**

Penelitian ini mencoba menganalisis penggambaran serangan Mumbai dan titik-titik kontradiksi dalam film Hotel Mumbai. Film ini dibuat berdasarkan peristiwa nyata serangan teroris Mumbai pada tahun 2008. Terkait dengan peristiwa besar ini, ada banyak buku sejarah yang telah meliput serangan teroris Mumbai. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk menemukan representasi kontradiktif dari film berdasarkan sejarah resmi. Penelitian ini dilakukan dengan menggunakan metode deskriptif dan pendekatan kualitatif. Dalam penelitian ini, peneliti mengambil data dari percakapan karakter dan framing mise-en-scene dalam film tersebut. Kajian ini dilakukan dengan menerapkan pendekatan historisisme baru dan unsur intrinsik sastra, peneliti akan membandingkan sejarah resmi dan film. Melalui pendekatan

e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

historisisme baru, peneliti menemukan bahwa film Hotel Mumbai menempatkan banyak perbedaan. Pertama, ada perbedaan mengenai penempatan karakter. Kedua, ada perbedaan mengenai struktur naratif Zahra — Seyfi & Meltem. Ketiga, terdapat perbedaan yang sangat jelas mengenai latar tempat dan waktu. Terakhir, film ini mengangkat unsur naratif untuk menunjukkan apa yang belum diketahui publik hanya dengan membaca sejarah versi resmi. Tujuannya adalah untuk menunjukkan bahwa film berbasis sejarah bertujuan untuk mendapatkan representasi yang sama dari narasi sejarah dengan sudut pandang yang berbeda.

Kata Kunci: Historisisme baru, Teroris, Hotel Mumbai, Serangan Mumbai.

### A. INTRODUCTION

A terrorist act is a form of communication meant to send a message of fear and intimidation, not just to the immediate victims but also to a broader audience (Anderson and Sloan 1). It can be said that terrorism is the activity of a group in the use of violence and other threat to lead to fear that is generally designed to influence other humans by creating a series of events. These events are mostly recorded in history through literary text and non-literary text.

In literary works, a historical context cannot be separated from the work because some literary critics criticize its accuracy based on it. This statement is supported by Barry's explanation in his book Beginning Theory which he said involves the parallel study of the literary and non-literary text, by looking at the essential connection from historical data (117). They are connected because the arguments about the meaning of literary texts are often very easy to describe by looking at history. However, no history or event can be understood and restated totally, objectively, and neutrally or as it actually happened in literary works.

Several films adapt to terrorist historical events. The interesting examples of historical-based films from Mumbai terrorist attacks are *The Attacks of 26/11* (2013), *Phantom* (2015), *One Less God* (2017), and *Hotel Mumbai* (2019). Among those films, *Hotel Mumbai* is the only film with a theme of the Mumbai terrorist attacks which contains contradictions between the official history and the film itself. Directed by Anthony Maras, it attempts to portray the terrifying incident of the Mumbai terrorist attacks. *Hotel Mumbai* vividly recounts the 2008 siege of the famed Taj Hotel by a group of terrorists in Mumbai, creating a threat to the staff and the guests. Starring Dev Patel, Armie Hammer, and Nazanin Boniadi, the film focuses on the stories of guests and staff trapped inside the Taj Mahal Palace Hotel for days as four-armed terrorists walk through the hall, then kill randomly. Furthermore, it briefly revisits the ease of the terrorist group arriving at the edge of the city and blending with the crowd, calling out like locals.

The director carried out some ambitious research into real attacks before filming. However, it cannot be separated from dramatization and some of it is done only for narrative purposes. Nevertheless, the accuracy of the story portrayed in the film is still questionable, from the setting time of the siege in the hotel, whether the characters are based on a real person or not, or the plot of the terrorist attacks itself.

Based on the contradictions explained above, the researcher analyzes *Hotel Mumbai* film to find out the director's point of view in the filmmaking and look for the essence of the film,



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

juxtaposing the historical text and the film. This study is not about comparing which one is true or false, not about seeking the validity of the film, but showing the emotion that is not recorded in history. This is done by applying Greenblatt's New Historicism which is considered effective for exploring the phenomenon of historical and literary texts to provide space for interpretation between "true or untrue". This happens because every culture has a different perspective and understanding of a thing. Moreover, the researcher analyzes the intrinsic elements of literature that can be found in the film to describe how Mumbai terrorist attacks are portrayed in the film.

By analyzing the selected issues, the researcher attempts to show that there is no totalizing history in literary works and to indicate the portrayal of the Mumbai terrorist attacks in Hotel Mumbai film. The researcher hopes that the readers are equipped with a deep sense of awareness concerning the Mumbai terrorist attacks. The results of the analysis are expected to give the reader an understanding of the director's mind who gives a different point of view in presenting the history of Mumbai. In addition, this research is also expected to be a reference for the students who study the theory of new historicism.

#### RELATED LITERATURE B.

#### 1. **Literature and Film**

Literature and film denote a communication for all readers where they are free to create visualizations in their minds based on the narrative and then translate them based on the recorded events they have experienced. Specifically, narrative as the communication in literature involves events, characters, and whatever the characters say and do. A narrative can be the verbal nature of the medium used to transmit the message. The narrative is not told but evolves by means of the direct presentation on the stage of the actions and speeches of the characters (Abrams 208). The medium can be images (films, cartoons, and paintings), bodily movements (dance, mime), and sounds (singing, musical instruments). All of them are the same, telling stories (Griffith 39).

#### 2. **New Historicism**

The term new historicism is first used by Stephen Greenblatt to offer a new perspective in renaissance studies, emphasizing the relationship between literary texts and the various social, economic, and political forces that surround them (Barry 116). By positioning the texts against the background of social and political information when they are produced or in the context of biographies, literary historians deliver readers the understanding of other ways of life. In this case, new historicism can be defined as a new understanding of assessing history that aligns the position of literary and non-literary texts.

To be concluded, according to Greenblatt, new historicist works are focused on the contradiction of any historical moment. This is done in the following steps:

- 1) One should begin with specific details and examples to avoid a totalizing version of history;
- 2) One should proceed from such details to illustrate how they are tied up with larger contradictory;

e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

3) All cultural products, whether they are high art, political documents, personal letters, or trash, are a part of larger discursive structures and so, can offer clues to the ideological contradictions of a given period (Felluga 198).

#### 3. The Historicity of Mumbai Terrorist Attacks

The researcher looks for the historicity of the Mumbai terrorist attacks through the historical book, papers, and other documentaries of a historian on the event. Since the event of the Mumbai terrorist attacks, some many historical books and papers reveal the detail of the event. One of the historical books is *The Siege: 68 Hours Inside the Taj Hotel* by Scott-Clark and Adrian Levy. This book is telling about the element report inside the Taj as the main theme of the film. The author briefly reveals the dramatic personae and the guests' list where they become a hostage. They have collaborated with everyone at the Taj who is still alive which means this book is really helpful for the researcher during the analysis to compare the accuracy with the film. The second one is a paper entitled *The Lessons of Mumbai* by Rand Corporation. This paper contains insight from officials and analysts inside and outside the U.S. and Indian governments who shared the attack and its significance. This paper identifies the operational and tactical features and technical capabilities of the terrorists. This paper also derives the lessons learned from the attack and the Indian response. Those sources are hopefully able to help the researcher, by seeking them one by one, it reveals the facts of the event and depicts the contradictions within the official history and the film.

#### 4. **Intrinsic Elements of Literary Work**

Intrinsic elements are part of an approach that analyzes literary works based on the text and structural points of literary works. In this research, the researcher focuses on the intrinsic elements of literary work that are classified into three classifications: plot, setting, characters, and characterization of the literary work.

#### **Plot** a.

According to Abrams, the plot is a bare synopsis of the temporal order of what happens. It specifies how the story relates to others, by causes and motivations, and in what ways all the stories are rendered, ordered, and organized to achieve the emotional effects (265). It can be said that a plot is the arrangement of story events that define a structure. There are five plot divisions according to Freytag's pyramid (1894) as bellows:

- 1) Exposition: The nature of a conflict or an unstable situation, usually the author introduces the characters, describes the setting, and provides the historical background (Freytag 36).
- 2) Rising Action: It usually provides one event that causes another event, or several events may be linked to the same cause. Each event intensifies the conflict to rise toward a climax (Freytag 39).

e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

- 3) Climax: This is the most intense event in the narrative or the rest of the story. The climax is the peak of the action and the turning point for the main character and the story (Freytag 40).
- 4) Falling Action: It contains events that are much less intense than the climax and that lead toward the resolution of the conflict toward a stable situation at the end (Freytag 42).
- 5) **Denouement**: Refers to the last phase where all of the characters both protagonist and antagonist have solved their problems (Freytag 42).

#### b. **Setting**

The setting may figure as more than mere background or underpinning. It can make things happen. It can prompt characters to act, bring them to realization, or cause them to reveal their inmost natures (Kennedy and Gioia 110). Furthermore, the setting has two elements. There are places and times to show how the characters act, how the characters socialize with others and how the characters show their human nature to the audience when they see it.

#### **Characters and Characterization** c.

In A Glossary of Literary Terms, Abrams defines the characters are the persons represented in a dramatic or narrative work, who is interpreted by the reader as being endowed with moral and dispositional qualities that are expressed in what they say - the dialogue - and what they do - the action (42). Therefore, characterization is needed in order to find out the characteristics of the character. According to Baldick, characterization refers to the presentation of persons in narrative or dramatic works by means of the character's action, speech, or physical appearance (37).

#### 5. Mise-en-scène

One of the most terms used in film analysis is *mise-en-scène*, the literal translation is "putting on stage" or staging". It can be said that *mise-en-scène* is everything that appears in the frame of film, the arrangement of all the visual elements of the production within a given stage. According to Corrigan, this term is used in its narrower sense to mean what appears in front of the camera such as set design, lighting, and character movement (51).

#### C. RESEARCH METHOD

#### 1. **Research Design**

Qualitative research is an array of attitudes and strategies to conduct an inquiry that is aimed at discerning how human beings understand, experience, interpret, and produce the social world (Bryman et al 893). History, literary criticism, ethics, and cultural material studies are examples of disciplines that are often viewed as qualitative research that uses a form of



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

document or artifact study for the techniques of analysis. Regarding the previous explanation, the researcher focuses on analyzing texts and pictures rather than numbers to analyze the historicity of the Mumbai terrorist attacks in the *Hotel Mumbai* film to understand more deeply how the non-literary texts are being interpreted in the literary texts. The juxtaposition between the historical texts and the film strongly reminds the qualities of life experiences rather than 'history'. Related to the statement, this research uses qualitative research methodology and the results of the data are written in the form of words and pictures.

#### 2. **Data and Data Sources**

Bryman et al. in The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods define data as the recorded empirical observations on the cases under study, such as gathering data from the historical document and direct field observation and any text form (234). This research uses Hotel Mumbai (2019) film directed by Anthony Maras as the main source of data. The main data are in the forms of historical texts, narration, dialogue, and action of the events that relate to the official history of Mumbai terrorist attacks in the *Hotel Mumbai* film.

To support the main data above, the researcher also needs other data called a secondary source. The secondary data of this research includes the historical books on Mumbai attacks such as The Siege: 68 Hours Inside the Taj Hotel and The Lessons of Mumbai, a review of previous studies, the books, journals, articles, websites, and other reliable sources that are related to the research.

#### 3. **Data Collection**

Data collection methods can be defined as the process and the way of conducting research. To gain a valid result for this kind of research, the first step that researcher uses is to watch the film entitled *Hotel Mumbai* several times. After watching the film, the researcher has to take some notes and gather the data through the event that portrays the Mumbai terrorist attacks in the film. Then, the researcher needs to re-watch the film to check and take some data that may have been missed. The last step is to categorize the data based on classifications, such as new historicism, plot, setting, characters, and characterization.

#### 4. **Data Analysis**

After collecting the data, the next step is analyzing the data. The researcher uses Barry's methodology of what new historicists do in new historicism (119-120). In the first step, the researcher compares the literary and non-literary texts. Second step, the researcher reads the non-literary texts from the same historical events as the film to find relevance or the parallel relationship between them. In the last step, the researcher focuses their attention on the issues within both text and co-text. The researcher analyzes the parallel relationship between literary and non-literary texts. The three points above serve as a guide in researching the Mumbai terrorist attacks in Hotel Mumbai film using a new historicism study. The portrayal of how Mumbai terrorist attack in the film is analyzed through the intrinsic elements. Such as plot, setting, characters, and characterization.



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

#### D. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

#### 1. The Intrinsic Elements of *Hotel Mumbai* Film

This part aims to show how the Taj hotel was being attacked by the terrorists that are represented in the filmmaking by using literary elements such as plot, setting, characters, and characterization. The *mise-en-scene* is also explained here to see how the film works to recreate the situation of such an event.

### a.

- 1) **Exposition:** In this film, the researcher can see the exposition started when the film begins. A group of 10 young men arrived on a small raft. Each of them was carrying a huge backpack and a cellphone with an earphone they used. The leader of the group called "brother bull" gave them instructions to convince them to carry out heinous attacks in the name of Jihad. The terrorists seem to have lost their way in life which only follows the orders of their brother. This is also supported when the director shows the blocking of terrorist groupings that are visible amounting to 10 people. The blocking is made very balanced and intact from an eye-level angle. This demonstrates a boat trip, so it had the center of attention when the movie started. It can also be seen that they are depicted with shabby looks from clothes, hairdos, and dull faces supported by yellowish color grading, this was shown as a pathetic sight. The narrative in this scene tells that after they reached the shore, they broke off into pairs and got into a taxi with different destinations. They split into four-team, two-person went to CST train station, two-person went to café lilopal, two others went to VT station, and the rest four of them went to Taj hotel which was the main target.
- 2) Rising Action: In this stage, in the kitchen, the head chef named Hemant Oberoi inspected the staff. He checked the attributes that must be worn to work, as well as the cleanliness of fingernails and haircuts. The director highlights and presents the initial news of the attacks at the CST train station. The terrorists who had dispersed according to the place as mentioned in the exposition above had been shooting blindly and indiscriminately. The technique of taking pictures with a medium close up aims to show the overall properties that exist. In the framing placement above, there are four culinary trophies lined up next to the television highlighting the news. The placement of the trophy in the framing shows that the Taj Mahal Palace hotel as a five-star luxury hotel has a cuisine that has been recognized as legit by obtaining the various trophies. The emphasis of information from a reporter who said "Gunning down more than 100 passengers and staff" indicates a foretelling of what was going to happen. The kitchen staff calmly prepared the dinner menus without realizing what was going to happen was a terrible thing.
- 3) Climax: The climax section of the film can make the reader want to know what is going to happen next and all the major action in the story comes to a head. Throughout the film, guests and staff were trapped inside the hotel, and terrorists were still walking around to shoot the hotel guests who were still alive. Arjun witnessed the carnage



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

from the restaurants and ordered the guests to hide under the tables and the staff to switch off the lights and lock the doors. The shows how the tension in the restaurant is portrayed. The atmosphere of the dinner that seems harmonious and warm suddenly becomes intense. Taking the quality of light with low contrast which is marked by the life of one lamp on the table shows the tension that exists, making them paralyzed by the situation. The lights went out, Zahra and David were hiding under the table following Arjun's order.

- 4) Falling Action: Derive to the falling action, the two terrorists who hijacked the car police are caught. One is killed and the other is taken into custody. There is a scene that looks like a terrorist who had been shot was being interrogated. He elaborated on how their superiors brainwashed the terrorists. they are brainwashed with the sentence that the terrorists are left with a life of poverty above all other pleasures. The camera property in the scene above shows a high angle so that terrorists are interpreted as being cornered when the interrogation process was broadcasted live on TV. Brother Bull who knew it was being messed up there, ordered the group to begin their final phase which was to burn down the hotel.
- 5) **Denouement:** At this point of denouement, all of the problems that the characters faced throughout the story are worked out and the story is concluded. In the last stage, the terrorists broke down the lounge door and chased the guests and staff who fled through the stairs. The terrorist still chasing and shooting the remaining guests and staff blindly. The closing text revealed that the Indian police killed 11 of the 12 terrorists after three days while capturing one alive. The mastermind of the plan remained missing to this day. Of the 31 people killed at the Taj Hotel, half were staff that stayed behind to help the guests. A scene that shows the 4:3 aspect ratio plays with grain as if the framing is a form of documentation. This scene takes a bird view shot, knobbing the Taj was reopened and restored to its former glory with Hemant Oberoi's help. The formal costumes used by Hemant Oberoi, as well as the typical Indian clothes worn by the woman, gave the impression of luxury and serenity after facing the chaos of the terrorist siege. To this day, some of the employees that work at the Taj are survivors of the attack.

#### b. **Setting**

In this part, to narrow down the study, the setting used in the analysis is a setting that focuses on place and time. The attacks in *Hotel Mumbai* film happened in 3 places, the first was in the CST Station – south Mumbai, the second was in the Café Lilopal – Colaba, Mumbai, and the last happened in the Taj hotel as the main siege place in this film. Furthermore, the director also describes the time of the attack, as shown above, namely 7 hours, and 9 hours, and the last one was 12 hours after the first attack. In the description of the time, the director always takes an angle on the state of the Taj hotel until the morning before. This makes the audience also feel

e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

the tension that occurred. The development of a timeline can be useful to give the reader an impression of the panic that is going on at the time.

#### **Characters and Characterization** c.

In this part, the writer identifies and describes the five main characters that appear most often in the film. Among them are; Arjun, Zahra and David, Hemant Oberoi. Furthermore, this part also describes the character of the terrorists here through their utterances and behavior.

**Arjun's Character Description**: The researcher had found two data as the evidence that Arjun's character is a confident, brave, and optimistic young man. The researcher also found that all the forms of life sacrifice that he does to save the guests, also reflected that he has a heroic character. The director describes Arjun's character as heroic to give the audience hope regarding the situation and also the tension.

Zahra and David's Character Description: The researcher had found that Zahra's character is a tense, sensitive, and tenacious mother. Her attitude toward other people is absentminded, although what she is going to do is for her family, she did not think about what is going to happen to other guests if she is caught up by the terrorist. Besides that, David had the character of a trustworthy and reliable husband who is able to balance all their family's decisions in the face of attack even though in the end he did not survive.

**Hemant Oberoi's Character Description:** The researcher notes that Hemant Oberoi's character is leadership, calm, sensible, and intelligent. With his character like that, he is able to lead the entire journey out of the hotel followed by his staff and guests. The director also spiced up Hemant Oberoi's character by uttering words that made him seem more sacrificial in front of his staff.

**Terrorist's Character Description:** The researcher concludes that terrorist character has reflected their innocent, thoughtless, and careless behavior, which they know is only limited to jihad in the wrong way. All they cared about was the attack plan directed by Brother Bull. Besides that, some of their wishes that cannot be conducted due to the doctrine had been reflected in their below-average naivety.

#### 2. The Historicity of Mumbai Terrorist Attacks

The attackers initially came by the sea of Mumbai, they sailed from Karachi on Pakistani cargo ships. When on November 22 or 23, they hijacked a trawler belonging to an Indian fisherman, these terrorists killed the rest of the crew, but they did not kill the captain to serve as an informant to continue to the Mumbai seas. In retrospect, landing by sea was the best way for terrorists to evade security checkpoints at Indian borders and airports. Arriving in Mumbai, the terrorists split into four teams, one team with four members and three teams with two members of each.

There were at least 6 places that were the main targets of terrorist attacks. All facilities attacked were easy targets, namely: Taj Mahal Hotel, Trident-Oberoi Hotel, Cama and Albless Hospital, Chatrapati Shivaji Terminus, Leopold Café, Jewish Chabad House. Meanwhile, the attackers were shooting along the road only to get more bodies of the fallen victims. Leopold cafés and the hotels themselves made for a dramatic setting for an attack, it could provide the



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

emotional value that terrorists seek. Furthermore, the massacre at the Jewish Chabad House was fairly easy to guess. According to the transcript of the phone call between the terrorists and their handlers, the terrorists at Jewish Chabad House were ordered to kill their Jewish hostages in order to damage relations between India and Israel (Rand Corporation 1).

The ten terrorists had been reported to be Pakistani youths in their early 20s. The surviving terrorist did not know much about his comrades, he reported that the team members were isolated from each other during the raid training. In the event of this attack, indirectly had created its own story for those who experienced it. Starting from the siege to the hostages and survivors themselves. Especially the siege that lasted for decades left scars for the victims who struggled to save themselves. Scott-Clark and Adrian Levy in their book of The Siege: 68 Hours Inside the Taj Hotel portrayed the experienced of Hemant Oberoi, a Taj's grand executive chef who had worked for the Tata group his entire career. He is also increasingly recognized by this attack as a survivor of his escape from the Taj hotel. Hemant Oberoi also formed a human chain to protect 60-70 guests as he escorted them from Wasabi, a Japanese restaurant, down a spiral staircase to the kitchen, and out (12).

Furthermore, there was Amit Peshave, who at that time was 27 years old, who worked as a 24-hour manager of the Shamiana coffee shop, one of the rooms in the Taj hotel. He also saw the attackers shooting around him, but he kept his guests calm and not distracted by the noise outside the room (Scott-Clark and Levy 114). Moreover, there is a story that makes this history in Mumbai so unforgettable. A 39-year-old general manager of the Taj hotel named Karambir Kang. His heroic act to save the lives of thousands of guests, even when his own family, wife Neeti and sons Uday and Samar, were suffocating on the burning sixth floor of Taj Hotel. He believed that what happened that day was a true expression of the employee's belief that the Taj was their family (Scott-Clark and Levy 334).

There is also a Turkish Muslim couple, named Seyfi and Meltem Muezzinoglu. They had seen the bodies of other hostages killed in the Trident Oberoi hotel, they prayed in Arabic chants during the execution and the terrorists stared at them dumbfounded, he did not believe it and started looking at the floor as he was ashamed (Scott-Clark and Levy 356).

Another story that portrayed the pity of terrorists was when Rakesh Maria, the legendary Crime Branch boss of Mumbai has solved the case and interrogated Ajmal Kasab (One of the terrorists that still alive). Additionally, Maria was going to interrogate him, Maria used words that could provoke Ajmal. He said that Ajmal had failed his mission because he did not die. The world would know how stupid Ajmal was when you expect Shaheed to die. God did not want it either and no one did, the story of his miserable life continued as it always had (Scott-Clark and Levy 297).

#### 3. The Contradictions between *Hotel Mumbai* Film and Official History

First, there are appointed characters that only appear in the film. These characters' names and characterization are invented by the director for the film narrative. This method is employed mainly to modify the characters based on what the director needs for his version of the story. It is also common that human emotions are not recorded in history. So, by making up characters and putting traits on their personalities, the audience is made easier to understand the historical events through the characters who struggle to escape the Mumbai attacks.



e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

Second, there is a different portrayal of narrative structure in the *Hotel Mumbai* film if compared to the historical record. Scenes like this appear for the dramatization of a film. Observing this film opens a different point of view on the attack, which focuses on the point of view of the human story. The importance of dramatization is to focus specifically on people who have experienced attacks to fight extremism. Thus, this second difference is on the aspect of occurred events where details in the films are not always in accord with the historical record, but the film may invite the audience to be aware of the experiences which are not recorded in

As the last contradictory aspect, there is a very clear difference between the place and time setting. In the *Hotel Mumbai* film, the attacks occurred in 24 hours. It is said that some of the other guests who survived were able to escape the next day. Meanwhile, what happened in history lasted for four days, starting from 26 to 29 November 2008 and it became a tense national and international media coverage, from minute to minute. Moreover, there are only three places under attack in the film. While as the historical record, there are at least six places. This is intended so that the film focuses more on the happenings in the hotel as is reflected in the film title. The director also takes the scenes of attacks at the CST station and Leopold café to support the main attack.

#### Ε. **CONCLUSION**

The director seems to be presenting a different point of view in *Hotel Mumbai* film. It is seen by how the director invents several characters inspired by real persons mentioned in the official history. It is done in order to make alterations as the director pleases on the characters and characterization for the building of the narrative. The director alters Seyfi-Meltem from the official history as Zahra in *Hotel Mumbai* film to aim for dramatization by displaying differences. Furthermore, there is Arjun's character to represent the heroism of India people. The director only display chosen settings as the places under attack to narrow down the focus solely into the terrorist attacks that happen in Taj hotel.

The researcher has concluded that the film has picked up the narrative elements to show what has not been known by the public only by reading the official version of history. Through this understanding, the researcher is not looking for the validity of who is superior between history and the work. The goal is to show that a historical-based film is aimed to gain equal representation of historical narratives from a different point of view. By presenting the contradictions, the researcher proves that this is also an important part of an understanding of how a film works to narrate historical events through creative effort and literary elements.

### WORKS CITED

Abrams, M.H. A Glossary of Literary Terms. Earl McPeek, 1999.

Baldick, Chris. The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms. Oxford University Press, 2001.

e-ISSN 2549-7715 | Volume 7 | Nomor 2 | April 2023 | Hal: 459-470 Terakreditasi Sinta 4

- Barry, Peter. Beginning Theory: An Introduction to Literary and Cultural Theory. Manchester University Press, 2020
- Bryman, A., et al. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods*. Sage Publications, 2004.
- Corrigan, Timothy. A Short Guide to Writing about Film. Pearson Education, 2010.
- Felluga, Dino. Critical Theory: The Key Concepts. Routledge, 2015.
- Freytag, Gustav. Freytag's Technique of the Drama: An Exposition of Dramatic Composition and Art. Scott, Foresman, and Company, 1900.
- Griffith, Kelly. Writing Essays about Literature: A Guide and Style Sheet. 8th Ed. Cengage Learning, 2011.
- Kennedy, X. J., and Dana Gioia. *Literature: An Introduction to Fiction, Poetry, Drama, and Writing*. Ed. Dan Stone. Pearson, 2013.
- Rabasa, Angel, et al. *The Lessons of Mumbai*. Vol. 249. Rand Corporation, 2009.
- Scott-Clark, Cathy, and Adrian Levy. The Siege: 68 Hours Inside the Taj Hotel. Penguin, 2013.
- Sloan, Stephen, and Sean K. Anderson. *Historical Dictionary of Terrorism*. Scarecrow Press, 2009.