

Search all conversations

Active

81 of 780

### Invitation to Review for the Economic Alternatives External Inbox x

**Pencho Penchev** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> Thu, Dec 23, 2021, 10:10 PM

to me

23-Dec-2021

Dear Dr. Wijaya:

Manuscript ID ecoalt-2021-0080 entitled "The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance" has been submitted to the Economic Alternatives.

I invite you to review this manuscript. The abstract appears at the end of this letter. Please let me know as soon as possible if you will be able to accept my invitation to review. If you are unable to review at this time, I would appreciate you recommending another expert reviewer. You may e-mail me with your reply or click the appropriate link at the bottom of the page to automatically register your reply with our online manuscript submission and review system.

Once you accept my invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail about how to access ScholarOne Manuscripts, our online manuscript submission and review system. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Center via the site link below.

<https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt>

I realize that our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and I thank you for your present and/or future participation.

Sincerely,  
 Dr. Pencho Penchev  
 Economic Alternatives Editor-in-Chief  
[pencho\\_penchev@gyuvetch.bg](mailto:pencho_penchev@gyuvetch.bg)

Search all conversations

Active

82 of 780

### Economic Alternatives - Account Created in ScholarOne Manuscripts External Inbox x

**Economic Alternatives** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> Thu, Dec 23, 2021, 10:09 PM

to me

23-Dec-2021

Dear Dr. Wijaya:

Welcome to the Economic Alternatives - ScholarOne Manuscripts site for online manuscript submission and review. Your name has been added to our reviewer database in the hopes that you will be available to review manuscripts for the Journal which fall within your area of expertise.

Your USER ID for your account is as follows:

SITE URL: <https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt>  
 USER ID: [adi.wijaya@feb.unmul.ac.id](mailto:adi.wijaya@feb.unmul.ac.id)  
 PASSWORD: To set your password please click the link below. Clicking the link will take you directly to the option for setting your permanent password.

[https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=c28998495b14f718c03fb4ee774d213](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=c28998495b14f718c03fb4ee774d213)

When you log in for the first time, you will be asked to complete your full postal address, telephone, and fax number. You will also be asked to select a number of keywords describing your particular area(s) of expertise.

Thank you for your participation.

Sincerely,  
 Associate Editor, Economic Alternatives

Log in to Remove This Account - [https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=4a9b874b60a24f3cb4a9c9b84f38f51](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=4a9b874b60a24f3cb4a9c9b84f38f51)

Search all conversations

Active

81 of 780

To respond automatically, click below:

\*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. \*\*\*

Agreed: [https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=4e9aec4c08b4720eaf017fed60e7df](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=4e9aec4c08b4720eaf017fed60e7df)

Declined: [https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=941a832bf6ce4bd6b2e7c841f048799](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=941a832bf6ce4bd6b2e7c841f048799)

Unavailable: [https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=6dfc7718a2484fe8c5ee8c0a94ab9bf](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=6dfc7718a2484fe8c5ee8c0a94ab9bf)

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance

ABSTRACT. This study explores market timing and stock selection by investment managers during the Covid-19 in Indonesia using the Treynor-Mazuy conditional exchange rate and inflation model. By applying several sample criteria to the population of mutual funds registered at OJK, we found 55 stock mutual funds using the purposive sampling technique. We processed data using the STATA16 computer program. The Treynor-Mazuy conditional inflation and exchange rate model, according to the findings of this study, can show that market timing and stock selection for mutual fund managers have a positive and significant impact on improving the performance of equity fund portfolios during the pandemic in Indonesia. In Indonesia, there are 5 equities mutual funds having positive or market timing skills, accounting for 9.09 percent of all equity mutual funds, whereas the remaining 90.91 percent do not. The positive coefficient of the gamma variable shows that the investment manager's ability to market time expected to result in higher stock mutual fund returns. Positive or stock selectivity characteristics are available in 45 equity mutual funds, or 81.18 percent.

Search all conversations

Active

80 of 780

Manuscript ID ecoalt-2021-0080 now in your Reviewer Center - Economic Alternatives External Inbox

Pencho Penchev <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> Fri, Dec 24, 2021, 10:08 PM

to me

24-Dec-2021

Dear Dr. Wijaya:

Thank you for agreeing to review Manuscript ID ecoalt-2021-0080 entitled "The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance" for Economic Alternatives. Please try your best to complete your review by 23-Jan-2022.

In your review, please answer all questions. On the review page, there is a space for "Comments to Editor" and a space for "Comments to the Author." Please be sure to put your comments to the author in the appropriate space.

To access just the manuscript for review directly with no need to enter log in details, click the link below:

[https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=b43a1f86693b483fb33dded31f9b0aaa](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=b43a1f86693b483fb33dded31f9b0aaa)

To login to your account on the Economic Alternatives - ScholarOne Manuscripts site at <https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt>, your case-sensitive USER ID is [adi.wijaya@feb.unmul.ac.id](mailto:adi.wijaya@feb.unmul.ac.id). For security purposes your password is not listed in this email. If you are unsure of your password you may click the link below to set a new password.

Search all conversations

Active

80 of 780

[https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL\\_MASK=cdd326bdf81482faf5f4e6340acb230](https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ecoalt?URL_MASK=cdd326bdf81482faf5f4e6340acb230)

Once you are logged in, the Main Menu will be displayed. Please click on the Reviewer Center, where you will find the manuscript listed under "Review and Score." You can click on the manuscript title from this point or you can click on the "Perform Review" button to begin reviewing the manuscript.

If you wish to view the manuscript and the review form simultaneously, click on the HTML or PDF icons – the manuscript will open in a new window. Leave the new window open, switch back to the main window, and open the score sheet by clicking on the Score Sheet tab. Follow the instructions for reviewers provided in the ScholarOne Manuscripts site. I strongly encourage you to elaborate on your review in the space provided. Your specific comments will offer valuable feedback to improve future work. It is essential that you click the "Save" button if you wish to exit the review before you submit it to the Editor. Otherwise, none of the information that you have entered will be saved in the system. When you have completed your review and are ready to submit it to the Editor, click on "Submit."

All communications regarding this manuscript are privileged. Any conflict of interest, suspicion of duplicate publication, fabrication of data or plagiarism must immediately be reported to me.

Thank you for evaluating this manuscript.

Sincerely,  
 Dr. Pencho Penchev  
 Economic Alternatives Editor-in-Chief  
[pencho\\_penchev@gyuvetch.bg](mailto:pencho_penchev@gyuvetch.bg)

Search all conversations

Active

79 of 780

Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID ecoalt-2021-0080 for the Economic Alternatives External Inbox x

Pencho Penchev <[onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com](mailto:onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com)> Dec 25, 2021, 1:10 AM

to me

24-Dec-2021

Dear Dr. Wijaya:

Thank you for reviewing manuscript # ecoalt-2021-0080 entitled "The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance" for the Economic Alternatives.

On behalf of the Editors of the Economic Alternatives, we appreciate the voluntary contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal. We thank you for your participation in the online review process and hope that we may call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

Sincerely,  
 Dr. Pencho Penchev  
 Editor-in-Chief, Economic Alternatives  
[pencho\\_penchev@gyuvetch.bg](mailto:pencho_penchev@gyuvetch.bg)

The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance

**Reviewer Affiliation**

Universitas Mulawarman Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis, Economics

**Manuscript ID:**

ecoalt-2021-0080

**Manuscript Type**

Original Article

**JEL Codes**

C24; E31; E64; A11; C52

**Keywords**

Treynor Mazuy, inflation, exchange rate, market timing, stock selection

**Date Assigned:**

24-Dec-2021

**Date Review Returned:**

24-Dec-2021

**M-Score for this manuscript:**

2.00

Questionnaire	Yes	No	Not applicable
Does the manuscript contain new and significant information to justify publication?	✓		
Does the Abstract (Summary) clearly and accurately describe the content of the article?		✓	
Is the problem significant and concisely stated?	✓		
Are the methods described comprehensively?	✓		
Are the interpretations and conclusions justified by the results?	✓		
Is adequate reference made to other work in the field?		✓	
Is the language acceptable?	✓		
Please rate the priority for publishing this article (1 is the highest priority, 10 is the lowest priority)			7

**Manuscript Structure**

Length of article is: Adequate

Number of tables is: Too many

Number of figures is: Too few

---

Please state any conflict(s) of interest that you have in relation to the review of this paper (state "none" if this is not applicable).

None

Rating	Excellent	Good	Average	Below Average	Poor
Interest	✓				
Quality			✓		
Originality		✓			
Overall		✓			

### Recommendation

Minor Revision

Would you be willing to review a revision of this manuscript?

Yes

### Confidential Comments to the Editor

Dear editors. I am very excited to review this manuscript. I appreciate the Editors (Prof/Dr) who have trusted me to comment in order to improve the quality of the manuscript. As proof of having done this work, I expect you to provide some kind of certificate. Of course this is very important for my academic career and reporting to the University.

### Comments to the Author

The authors need to immediately revise the manuscript. Any form of constructive comments by reviewers is mandatory. Consider adding a few sentences in the Abstract section, regarding the contributions and weaknesses of the study. In addition, the reference section should not display too many journals and books from your area. This will be in the spotlight, so that the responsibility of the authors is questioned.

### Files attached

---

**Author's Response**  
Files attached

---

## Details

All articles published in *Economic Alternatives* have undergone rigorous peer review, based on initial screening by the editors and refereeing by anonymous expert referees.

Peer review of the *Economic Alternatives* in general follows four-stage procedure.

**The first stage begins** with submitting your article to a journal. At this first stage, the journal editor will decide if it's suitable for the journal, asking questions such as:

- A) Has the author followed the journal's guidelines?
- B) Is this the right journal for this article?
- C) Will the journal's readers find it interesting and useful?

The editor might reject the article immediately, but otherwise it will move to the next stage, and into peer review.

### Stage two: First round of peer review

The editor-in-chief finds and contacts between 2 and 5 researchers/academics who are experts in your field. It is important for authors to know that the reviewers are not from your country/university or institution. The main source of appropriate independent reviewers is the system ScholarOne. The reviewers will be asked to read your article, to assess it, and advise the editor-in-chief whether to publish your paper in that journal.

They would give an opinion whether:

- A) your work is original or new;
- B) your methodology is appropriate and described so that others could replicate what you've done;
- C) you've presented your results clearly and appropriately;
- D) your conclusions are reliable and significant;
- E) the work is of a high enough standard to be published in the journal.

You'll then be given feedback about your article, telling you if any changes need to be made before it can be published. Please note the final editorial decision on a paper and the choice of who to invite to review is always at the editor's discretion. If the paper does not maintain sufficiently high academic standards, it may be rejected at this point.

### Stage three: Revise and resubmit

You can then amend your article based on the reviewers' comments, resubmitting it with any or all changes made.

If you decide you don't want to accept all the reviewers' comments, you can include a brief explanation of why you don't believe they are applicable with your resubmitted article. The editor can then make an assessment, and include your explanation when the amended article is sent back to the reviewers.

### Stage four: Accepted

If the paper finally meets the editorial and reviewers standards it is accepted for publication. And that's it, you've made it through peer review.

**Note:** It might take 1-12 months between the acceptance and publication of the paper.



## Source details

Feedback > Comp

### Economic Alternatives

Scopus coverage years: from 2021 to Present

Publisher: University of National and World Economy

ISSN: 1312-7462 E-ISSN: 2367-9409

Subject area: Economics, Econometrics and Finance: General Economics, Econometrics and Finance

Source type: Journal

View all documents >

Set document alert

Save to source list Source Homepage

**Economic Alternatives**

Q4

Economics, Econometrics and Finance...  
best quartile

SJR 2022  
0.13

powered by scimagojr.com

CiteScore 2022

0.3

SJR 2022

0.130

SNIP 2022

0.143



**UNIVERSITY OF NATIONAL AND WORLD ECONOMY**  
*The Spirit Makes The Power*

**The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance**

Journal:	<i>Economic Alternatives</i>
Manuscript ID	ecoalt-2021-0080
Manuscript Type:	Original Article
Keywords:	Treynor Mazuy, inflation, exchange rate, market timing, stock selection
JEL Codes:	C24; E31; E64; A11; C52

SCHOLARONE™  
Manuscripts

**Introduction**

The Covid-19 pandemic that ravaged Indonesia caused social constraints; there was a volatile health and economic crises, with a drop in people’s purchasing power, while communal income remained unchanged, if not declining (e.g. Oyinlola et al., 2021). Of course, this has a negative influence on the country’s economy, particularly the inflation rate and exchange rate, which are employed as indicators in the Treynor-Mazuy model’s conditional model calculation.

**Comment [i-1]:** Need to add more LR and with recent LR. Other aspect of this article is acceptable to me.

The Treynor Mazuy conditional model is used to test market timing ability and stock selection skill using the same theoretical assumptions as the Treynor Mazuy unconditional model. Deb et al. (2007) discovered favorable but not significant selectivity results for stock mutual funds using the conditional method; this suggests that investment managers do poorly in stock selection when considering economic conditions in a country. Stock selection has a favorable and significant effect on stock mutual fund performance, according to research (Anita, 2013), but market timing ability has a negative effect on stock mutual fund performance.

Inflation’s relative increase might be a decent indicator for capital market investors. When examined using the conditional model, the results of Anita’s research (2013) reveal that inflation has a considerable negative effect on performing equities mutual funds. Mutual fund investors used inflation information on average to make investment decisions; if inflation is high, the rate of return on mutual funds will increase; if inflation is low, the rate of return on mutual funds will decrease.

When the rupiah decreases in value, stock prices decrease as foreign investors exit the Indonesian stock market by selling shares. The net asset value (NAV) of mutual funds dropped because of declining investment and decreasing stock prices. If the rupiah exchange rate strengthens, the stock price will rise. The rupiah exchange rate influences the performance of equities. In the stock market, mutual fund investors rely on information on changes in the rupiah exchange rate to make investment decisions; if the exchange rate changes are large, the mutual fund return rate will fall, and vice versa if the exchange rate changes are small.

We structure this article into five parts. Structure 1 highlights the background. It described the literature review in structure 2. Structured 3, data and empirical methods as instruments in data interpretation. We describe the results and discussion of structure 4 and the last is the conclusion which occupies structure 5.

**1. Literature review**

Treynor-Mazuy is a research method that has not been widely used in Indonesia (for example Paramita and Sembiring, 2018; Naveed et al., 2020). This model applies to the possibility of risks and the expected rate of return, which varies depending on the economic conditions in each country. Because the conditional model, which considers inflation and exchange rate conditions, to have better capabilities than the unconditional model, we expect it to outperform the unconditional model.

Market index movements and macroeconomic factors influenced the rate of return on a stock portfolio, such as inflation, interest rate changes, and economic growth. As a result, it must assess economic conditions, as well as their significance for the capital market (Elton et al., 2009), model Treynor-Mazuy conditional is:

$$Rp_t = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1.DP_{t-1} + \alpha_2.TB_{t-1} + \alpha_3.FX_{t-1} + \beta_0.Rm_t + \beta_1.Rm_t.DP_{t-1} + \beta_2.Rm_t.TB_{t-1} + \beta_3.FX_{t-1} + \gamma Rm_t^2 + \epsilon p \quad (1)$$



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

Where:  $R_p$  = return portofolio reksa dana;  $R_m$  = return market pada periode  $t$ ;  $DP$ = market dividen yield;  $TB$ = treasury bill interest rate;  $FX$ = yield on exchange rate fluctuation; and  $\epsilon_p$  = random error.

Grinblatt and Titman (1995), Agarwal and Pradhan (2018), and Panda et al. (2015) derive the components in the Treynor Mazuy regression formula from the portfolio return minus the risk-free return for period  $t$ ; the value of the reduction is the same as the alpha component added the first beta, which is multiplied by market return after deducting the risk-free return, then the second beta multiplied by macroeconomic elements multiplied by the alpha component. If there is over one macroeconomic element, repeat the computation using market return minus risk-free return, then add gamma multiplied by market return minus the squared risk-free return.

The macroeconomic values put in the regression model will influence the value of the alpha, beta, and gamma coefficients got by the conditional formula (Issah and Antwi, 2017). Managers will evaluate the macroeconomic conditions of a country when deciding on investment management measures in the conditional model (Koju et al., 2020). If a manager is attentive in predicting the economic state of his country and its expectations, his abilities will cause the positive value of an organization he manages (Carnevale and Hatak, 2020).

Inflation is one of the economic indicators marked by an increase in the price of needs in the market, hence this condition can describe a reduction in people's purchasing power because of rising prices in the conditional model. The rise in people's income does not keep pace with their needs. When inflation rises, Bank Indonesia will raise the SBI interest rate to keep inflation from bay and encourage investors to keep investing in the stock market. The exchange rate is the value of one currency in relation to other currencies. A status of a country's economy can be reflected in currency exchange rates. The stability of a growing exchange rate shows that the country in question is in reasonably excellent economic shape (Salvatore, 1997).

Changes in a country's exchange rate affect general economic conditions, primarily people's purchasing power, that are affected by changes in the consumer price index. According to Taylor (1995), the exchange rate's significance has grown significantly in recent years, mainly since the establishment of the Euro currency and the financial crisis. The movement of capital flows is better described by changes in exchange rates and stock prices. The major result of the portfolio method is a decrease in stock prices, which generates a decrease in the wealth of domestic investors, who are the drivers of money demand, and this can cause a decline in interest rates.

## 2. Data and empirical methods

There are 273 equity mutual funds in the population. Researchers chose this time period because Indonesia had an economic crisis precipitated by the Covid-19 outbreak in the 2020s, making it a good research reference point.

There were 58 mutual funds that met the sample requirements of having assets under management of over 500 billion rupiah, and there were three stock mutual funds whose data availability was incomplete throughout the research period, thus we gained 55 stock mutual fund samples. Because the enormous number of managed funds shows high public trust in mutual fund businesses, the examination is limited to mutual funds with AUM above 500 billion rupiah.

NAV data from each mutual fund sample during the observation period, BI rate information, JCI data, inflation data, and the rupiah exchange rate during the observation period are among the data collected. The STATA16 computer application is used to process the data that has been got (see Table 1).

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

### 3. Results and discussion

Table 2 shows a minimum value of -6.934006 originating from Mandiri Dynamic Equity mutual funds with investment manager PT. Mandiri Manajemen Investasi, and a maximum value of 23,25468 originating from Pan Arcadia Dana Saham Growing with investment management PT. Pan Arcadia Capital. The mean value got is -2.256315, with a standard deviation of 5.574203, showing a data spread of 55.74 percent on the independent variable market timing ability conditional model. Compared to other companies, the market timing ability conditional model data fluctuation in each observed firm was substantially higher and showed the highest level of variability.

The Pan Arcadia Mutual Fund, the Growing Stock Fund, with PT. Pan Arcadia Capital as investment manager, has a minimum value of -0.0584528, while the Sam Indonesian Equity Fund, with PT. Samuel Asset Management as investment manager, has a maximum value of 0.1068816.

The average result is 0.005566. The standard deviation of 0.0199809 shows the level of distribution of the independent variable data from the stock selection skill conditional model of 1.20 percent. In the results of the Kolmogorov-Smirnov normality test show the residual probability level of  $0.306 > 0.05$ , these results show the data was normally distributed. From the Table 4 and Table 5 shows that the results of the multicollinearity test show the VIF value exceeds 10, meaning that it is free of multicollinearity.

The ARCH test shows the probability value of Lag-residual of 0.970, which is more than the coefficient value of 0.05, then heteroscedasticity does not occur in the research data (see Table 6). The results of the autocorrelation test using the Lagrange Multiplier Test (LM test) show that the value of lag-residual is above the significance value of 0.05, shows that the data is free of autocorrelation. From the Table 7, we can explain it:

$$\text{Sharpe ratio} = 0.143 + 0.012 \text{ MTA conditional} + 1.117 \text{ SSS conditional} \quad (2)$$

Where: T-table (2.004879), and F-table (3.168246). The Sharpe ratio shows that the market timing ability conditional model variable has a considerable positive effect on performing stock mutual funds. These findings show that inflation and exchange rates have a major impact on market timing management by assessing an investment manager's ability to decide about when to sell and buy stocks in order to improve the performance of an equity mutual fund portfolio. In the Covid-19 situation that occurred in Indonesia, the market timing ability conditional model of the investment manager shows a positive direction, showing that the manager's ability to manage the portfolio considered in increasing the rate of return of his portfolio with the conditional model of inflation and exchange rates.

This study's findings are consistent with Deb et al., (2007), Anita, (2013), Mustofa and Kusumawardhani (2016), and Maulana and Ardiansari (2017), all of whom found conditional market timing to be favorable and significant in improving the performance of equity mutual fund portfolios.

During the pandemic in Indonesia, fluctuations in the value of inflation and the rupiah exchange rate had a positive and significant impact on the selection of stock mutual funds, where investment managers were careful in choosing the stocks they managed, but economic conditions were unpredictable.

According to the Treynor-Mazuy Conditional model's recapitulation, which shown in table 4, there are 5 equity mutual funds in Indonesia, or 9.09 percent, with positive or market timing capabilities, while the remaining 90.91 percent do not. The gamma variable's coefficient is positive, showing that the investment manager's ability to market time is predicted to lead to higher stock mutual fund returns. When making investment selections, investment managers should take inflation and the rupiah currency

rate into account. If inflation rises, which is followed by an increase in firm costs and a decrease in profitability, mutual fund demand will decrease.

Stock selection skill is a conditional model variable that has a positive and large impact on stock mutual fund performance. It described the capacity of stock selection conditional models of investment managers to increase mutual fund performance in this paper, which describes the activities of investment managers in their ability to choose stocks. The mutual fund's performance improves as the investment manager's stock selection competence improves. In the presence of macroeconomic variables as control variables in the Treynor-Mansuy, which allows investment managers to improve the performance of stock mutual fund portfolios through stock picking abilities.

According to the Treynor-Mazuy conditional model's recapitulation had shown in Table 8, 45 equity mutual funds (81.18 percent) have positive or have stock selectivity capabilities. Another 18.82 percent cannot choose their own stocks. The findings of this study are comparable to those of Paramita et al., (2017), who found that mutual fund investment managers' stock selection skills and market timing abilities are stronger in times of crisis than in periods of stability. This is because, during a crisis, investment managers are more cautious in their decisions.

The alpha variable's coefficient is positive, showing that the investment manager's stock selection ability contributes to a decrease in stock mutual fund returns. When the rupiah weakens, stock prices fall as foreign investors sell their shares and exit the Indonesian capital market, resulting in a decline in stock prices, which leads mutual fund NAVs to decrease, and vice versa.

## Conclusion

Interestingly, the conditional model of investment managers requires inflation and exchange rates into consideration while making management decisions, resulting in positive and significant results. The results show an exorbitant amount of positive numbers, as well as 5 equity funds is 9.09 percent having market timing ability. In the conditional model shows that stock selection skills have a positive and significant coefficient value on stock mutual fund performance. The number of investment managers with the ability to choose stocks was determined to be 81.18 percent in the conditional model during the epidemic that sparked the crisis.

Only one stock mutual fund, the Sam Indonesia Equity Fund mutual fund from the investment manager of PT. Samuel Asset Management, was found to have both market timing and positive stock selection capabilities when the conditional model was calculated. According to Sharpe's estimate, the Sam Indonesia Equity Fund mutual fund has a good timing capability of 10,8225 and a stock selection capability of 0.1069, resulting in outstanding performance. The public's faith in this investment manager is similarly high, with assets under management (AUM) exceeding 1 trillion rupiah throughout the research period. Based on the conditional model, 1.82 percent of funds are invested.

## References

- Agarwal, P.K., and Pradhan, H.K., (2018). "Mutual fund performance using unconditional multifactor models: evidence from India", *Journal of Emerging Market Finance*, 17(2), S157–S184.
- Alexandri, M.B., (2015). "Mutual fund performance: stock selection or market timing", *Proceedings of the International Conference on Economics and Banking 2015*, pp. 173-179.
- Amalia, D., and Sihombing, P., (2014). "Analisis kemampuan stock selection dan market timing pada reksa dana saham di Indonesia periode Januari 2008-Juli 2013", *Journal of Capital Market and Banking*, 2(2), 1–11.

**Comment [i-2]:** The reference section should not display too many journals and books from your area. This will be in the spotlight, so that the responsibility of the authors is questioned.

- 1  
2  
3 Anita, A., (2013). "Pengukuran pemilihan saham dan penetapan waktu menggunakan model Treynor-  
4 Mazuy pada Reksadana Syariah di Indonesia", *Etikonomi*, 12(1), 1-20.
- 5  
6 Azis, M., Sri, M., and Nadir, M., (2015). *Manajemen Investasi fundamental, teknikal, perilaku investor*  
7 dan return saham. Yogyakarta: Deepublish.
- 8  
9 Bauer, R., Otten, R., and Rad, A.T., (2006). "New Zealand mutual funds: measuring performance and  
10 persistence in performance", *Accounting and Finance*, 46(3), 347–363.
- 11  
12 Carnevale, J.B., and Hatak, I., (2020). "Employee adjustment and well-being in the era of COVID-19:  
13 implications for human resource management", *Journal of Business Research*, 116(4), 183–187.
- 14  
15 Comer, G., (2006). "Hybrid mutual funds and market timing performance", *Journal of Business*, 79(2),  
16 771–797.
- 17  
18 Cuthbertson, K., Nitzsche, D., and O’Sullivan, N., (2010). "The market timing ability of UK mutual  
19 funds", *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 37(1–2), 270–289.
- 20  
21 Deb, S.G., Banerjee, A., and Chakrabarti, B.B., (2007). "Market timing and stock selection ability of  
22 mutual funds in India: An empirical investigation", *Vikalpa*, 32(2), 39–51.
- 23  
24 Drew, M.E., Veeraraghavan, M., and Wilson, V., (2005). "Market timing, selectivity and alpha  
25 generation: Evidence from Australian equity superannuation funds", *Investment Management and*  
26 *Financial Innovations*, 2(2), 111–127.
- 27  
28 Elton, E.J., Gruber, M.J., Brown, S.J., and Goetzmann, W.N. (2009). *Modern portfolio theory and*  
29 *investment analysis*. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons.
- 30  
31 Ferson, W.E., and Schadt, R.W. (1996). "Measuring fund strategy and performance changing economic  
32 conditions", *Journal of Finance*, 51(2), 425–461.
- 33  
34 Grinblatt, M., and Titman, S., (1995). "Chapter 19 performance evaluation", *Handbooks in Operations*  
35 *Research and Management Science*, 9, 581-609.
- 36  
37 Gujarati, D.N., and Porter, D.C. (2003). *Basic econometrics* (ed.). Singapore: McGraw Hill Book.
- 38  
39 Hartono, J. (2013). *Teori Portofolio dan analisis investasi*, 7<sup>th</sup> ed. Yogyakarta: BPFE.
- 40  
41 Issah, M., and Antwi, S., (2017). "Role of macroeconomic variables on firms’ performance: evidence  
42 from the UK", *Cogent Economics & Finance*, 5(1), 1405581.
- 43  
44 Indonesia Stock Exchange., (2018). Reksa dana. Available: [idx.co.id/produk/reksa-dana/](http://idx.co.id/produk/reksa-dana/) [Accessed 15  
45 August 2021].
- 46  
47 Jensen, M.C., (1964). "The Performance of mutual funds in the period 1945-1964\*", *Journal of Finance*,  
48 23(2), 389–416.
- 49  
50 Kaur, I., (2013). "Performance, timing and selectivity skills of Indian equity mutual funds: an empirical  
51 approach", *Journal of Arts, Science and Commerce*, IV(4), 87–94.
- 52  
53 Koju, L., Koju, R., and Wang, S., (2020), "Macroeconomic determinants of credit risks: evidence from  
54 high-income countries", *European Journal of Management and Business Economics*, 29(1), 41-53
- 55  
56 Koulis, A., Beneki, C., Adam, M., and Botsaris, C., (2011). "An assessment of the performance of greek  
57 mutual equity funds selectivity and market timing", *Applied Mathematical Sciences*, 5(4), 159–171.
- 58  
59 Lee, W., and Lee, J., (2012). "A study on Taiwan’s bond market integrity and market timing ability -  
60 based on the Armax-Garch model", *Asian Economic and Financial Review*, 2(8), 991–1000.
- Maulana, F., and Ardiansari, A., (2017). "Stock selection and market timing of Indonesia sharia equity  
mutual funds", *ATESTASI: Jurnal Ilmiah Akuntansi*, 2(1), 21-30.

- 1  
2  
3 Murhadi, W.R., (2010). "Mutual funds performance evaluation based on selectivity and market timing",  
4 *Iqtishoduna*, 7(2), 1-12.
- 5  
6 Musah, A., Senyo, D.B., and Nuhu, E., (2014). "Market timing and selectivity performance of mutual  
7 funds in Ghana", *Management Science Letters*, 4(7), 1361–1368.
- 8  
9 Mustofa, F.S., and Kusumawardhani, A., (2016). "Pengaruh stock selection ability dan market timing  
10 ability terhadap menggunakan model conditional dan unconditional pada periode 2009–2015",  
11 *Diponegoro Journal of Management*, 5(3), 746–755.
- 12  
13 Naveed, F., Khawaja, I., and Maroof, L., (2020). "Are Islamic mutual funds exposed to lower risk  
14 compared to their conventional counterparts? empirical evidence from Pakistan", *ISRA International  
15 Journal of Islamic Finance*, 12(1), 69-87.
- 16  
17 Nofiatin, I., (2013). "Hubungan inflasi, suku bunga, produk domestik bruto, nilai tukar, jumlah uang  
18 beredar, dan indeks harga saham gabungan (IHSG) periode 2005–2011", *JAM: Jurnal Aplikasi  
19 Manajemen*, 11(2), 215–222.
- 20  
21 Olbryś, J., (2011). "ARCH effect in classical market-timing models with lagged market variable: the case  
22 of Polish market", *Dynamic Econometric Models*, 11, 185-222.
- 23  
24 Oyinlola, M.A., Oloko, T.F., and Orekoya, S., (2021). "Ratchet effect in import prices – inflation rate  
25 nexus", *Economic Alternatives*, 3, 335-354.
- 26  
27 Panda, B., Mahapatra, R.P., and Moharana, S., (2015). "Myth of equity mutual fund performance",  
28 *Vision*, 19(3), 200–209.
- 29  
30 Panjaitan, M.V., (2012). "Analisis kemampuan stock selection dan market timing manajer investasi pada  
31 reksadana saham di Indonesia", *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Manajemen*, 1(2), 1–6.
- 32  
33 Paramita, V.S., Sembiring, F.M., and Safitri, D., (2018). "Measuring selectivity and market timing  
34 performance of mutual funds in Indonesia using single and dual beta models", *KnE Social Sciences*,  
35 3(10), 1800-1809.
- 36  
37 Paramita, V.S., Jafar, B., and Siregar, I.W., (2017). "Market timing and stock selection performance of  
38 mutual fund in bull and bear market condition", *International Journal of Monetary Economics and  
39 Finance*, 10(3–4), 309–321.
- 40  
41 Philippas, N., (2011). "Market timing and selectivity: an empirical investigation into the features of greek  
42 mutual fund managers", *Journal of Applied Business Research*, 18(3), 97–108.
- 43  
44 Safitri, K., (2020). *6 bulan pandemi Covid-19, bagaimana dampaknya ke pergerakan saham di  
45 indonesia?*. Available: [https://money.kompas.com/read/2020/09/02/155619126/6-bulan-pandemi-covid-  
46 19-bagaimana-dampaknya-ke-pergerakan-saham-di-indonesia?page=all](https://money.kompas.com/read/2020/09/02/155619126/6-bulan-pandemi-covid-19-bagaimana-dampaknya-ke-pergerakan-saham-di-indonesia?page=all) [Accessed 19 September 2021].
- 47  
48 Salvatore, D., (1997). *Ekonomi internasional*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- 49  
50 Taylor, M.P., (1995). "The economics of exchange rates", *Journal of Economic Literature*, 33(1), 13-47.
- 51  
52 Sholihin, M., and Anggraini, P.G., (2020). *Analisis data penelitian menggunakan software STATA*.  
53 Yogyakarta: Andi.
- 54  
55 Bank of Indonesia., (2021). *Inflasi 2020 rendah*. Available: [www.bi.go.id](http://www.bi.go.id).  
56 [https://www.bi.go.id/id/publikasi/ruang-media/news-release/Pages/sp\\_230221.aspx](https://www.bi.go.id/id/publikasi/ruang-media/news-release/Pages/sp_230221.aspx) [Accessed 7  
57 November 2021].
- 58  
59 Tandelilin, E., (2010). *Portofolio dan investasi: teori dan aplikasi*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- 60  
61 Tari, D.N., (2021). *Dua indikator makroekonomi ini jadi sumber kekuatan rupiah*. Available:  
62 <https://market.bisnis.com/read/20210323/93/1371108/dua-indikator-makroekonomi-ini-jadi-sumber->

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51

kekuatan-rupee [Accessed 23 October 2021].

Utami, M., and Rahayu, M., (2003). "Peranan profitabilitas, suku bunga, inflasi dan nilai tukar dalam mempengaruhi pasar modal Indonesia selama krisis ekonomi", *Jurnal Manajemen and Kewirausahaan*, 5(2), 123–131.

Waelan, W., (2008). Kemampuan memilih saham dan market timing manajer investasi reksa dana", *Jurnal Akuntansi dan Auditing Indonesia*, 12(2), 167–176.

Widjaja, G., (2006). *Reksa dana and peran serta tanggung jawab manajer investasi dalam pasar modal*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.

For Review Only

54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

### The Treynor-Mazuy Conditional Model: Overview of Market Timing and Stock Selection on Equity Mutual Funds Performance

#### Abstract

This study explores market timing and stock selection by investment managers during the Covid-19 in Indonesia. By applying several sample criteria to the population of mutual funds registered at OJK, we found 55 stock mutual funds using the purposive sampling. We processed data using the STATA16 computer program. The Treynor-Mazuy conditional inflation and exchange rate model, according to the findings of this study, can show that market timing and stock selection for mutual fund managers have a positive and significant impact on improving the performance of equity fund portfolios during the pandemic in Indonesia. In Indonesia, there are 5 equities mutual funds having positive or market timing skills, accounting for 9.09 percent of all equity mutual funds, whereas the remaining 90.91 percent do not. The positive coefficient of the gamma variable shows that the investment manager's ability to market time expected to result in higher stock mutual fund returns. Positive or stock selectivity characteristics are available in 45 equity mutual funds, or 81.18 percent. The contribution of this study focuses on exchange rate and inflation. However, there needs to be a relevant follow-up comparison before the pandemic occurs. In addition, it is necessary to consider other elements in the macro-economy.

**Comment [i-3]:** The authors need to immediately revise the manuscript. Any form of constructive comments by reviewers is mandatory. Consider adding a few sentences in the Abstract section, regarding the contributions and weaknesses of the study.

**Table 1. Variable measurement**

Variabel	Operational Definition	Measuremet
Mutual fund performance	Indicators for assessing a mutual fund	Sharpe ratio
Market timing ability	Ability to read and forecast market situation	Treynor-Mazui model: $Rp - Rf = \alpha + \beta_1 (Rm - Rf) + \beta_2$ (inflation) $(Rm - Rf) + \beta_3$ (exchange rate) $(Rm - Rf) + \gamma (Rm - Rf)^2 + \epsilon p$
Stock selection skill	Ability to determine the selected stock	Treynor-Mazui model: $Rp - Rf = \alpha + \beta_1 (Rm - Rf) + \beta_2$ (inflation) $(Rm - Rf) + \beta_3$ (exchange rate) $(Rm - Rf) + \gamma (Rm - Rf)^2 + \epsilon p$
Inflation	Inflation is measured by recording the inflation rate of the national consumer price index published by BI during the study period	$\text{Inflation} = \frac{HK_n - HK_{n-1}}{HK_{n-1}} \times 100\%$
Exchange rate	The exchange rate is measured using the middle rate of the US dollar against the rupiah during the study period	$ER \text{ ratio} = \frac{ER_t - ER_{t-1}}{ER_{t-1}}$

Source: Bank of Indonesia (2021).

**Table 2. Descriptive statistics**

Variable	Obs	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max
kinerja	55	.122061	.0984873	-.1247642	.4709219
markettiming	55	-2.256315	5.574203	-6.934006	23.25468
stockselec~n	55	.005566	0.120809	-.0584528	.1068816

Source: calculated by STATA 16.

**Tabel 3. Normality test**

Smaller group	D	P-value
Residual:	0.1038	0.306
Cumulative:	-0.1515	0.080
Combined K-S:	0.1515	0.160

Source: calculated by STATA 16.

**Table 4. Multicollinearity test**

Variable	VIF	1/VIF
markettiming	1.11	0.900362
stockselec~n	1.11	0.900362
Mean VIF	1.11	

Source: calculated by STATA 16.



**Table 5. Heteroscedasticity test**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs	=	54
Model	2.4289e-07	1	2.4289e-07	F(1, 52)	=	0.00
Residual	.008899747	52	.000171149	Prob > F	=	0.9701
				R-squared	=	0.0000
				Adj R-squared	=	-0.0192
Total	.008899989	53	.000167924	Root MSE	=	.01308

  

Residual2	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
Lag_Residual2	-.0052223	.1386263	-0.04	0.970	-.2833963	.2729517
_cons	.0055717	.0019362	2.88	0.006	.0016864	.0094571

Source: calculated by STATA 16.

**Table 6. Autocorrelation test**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs	=	53
Model	.010243676	4	.002560919	F(4, 48)	=	0.43
Residual	.288367589	48	.006007658	Prob > F	=	0.7889
				R-squared	=	0.0343
				Adj R-squared	=	-0.0462
Total	.298611264	52	.005742524	Root MSE	=	.07751

  

Residual	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
markettiming	-.0002556	.0020045	-0.13	0.899	-.004286	.0037748
stockselection	-.0200955	.5572225	-0.04	0.971	-1.140466	1.100275
Lag_Residual_1	.0716579	.1437973	0.50	0.621	-.217466	.3607817
Lag_Residual_2	.1660969	.1437034	1.16	0.253	-.1228381	.4550319
_cons	.0012739	.0116078	0.11	0.913	-.0220652	.024613

Source: calculated by STATA 16.

**Table 7. Multiple regression**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs	=	55
Model	.221416134	2	.110708067	F(2, 52)	=	19.04
Residual	.302370342	52	.005814814	Prob > F	=	0.0000
				R-squared	=	0.4227
				Adj R-squared	=	0.4005
Total	.523786476	54	.00969975	Root MSE	=	.07625

  

kinerja	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
markettiming	.0121049	.0019619	6.17	0.000	.008168	.0160418
stockselection	1.117081	.5473267	2.04	0.046	.0187899	2.215373
_cons	.1431639	.0112288	12.75	0.000	.1206316	.1656962

*Source:* calculated by STATA 16.

Table 8. Recapitulation of Treynor Mazuy calculation

NO	Mutual Funds	Y	X3 Condi	X4 Condi	Share Ratio	MTA conditio nal	SS conditio nal
		Perform RD	$\gamma$	$\alpha$			
1	Schroder Dana Prestasi Plus	0.0714	-1.3050	-0.0007	√	-	-
2	Batavia Dana Saham	0.0815	-3.4152	0.0036	√	-	√
3	Ashmore Dana Ekuitas Nusantara	0.1292	-1.2085	0.0043	√	-	√
4	Schroder Dana Prestasi	0.1017	-2.1668	0.0038	√	-	√
5	Mandiri Saham Atraktif	0.0945	-4.8569	0.0058	√	-	√
6	Manulife Dana Saham Utama	0.2267	-2.7103	0.0161	√	-	√
7	Ashmore Dana Progresif Nusantara	0.1635	-4.4545	0.0203	√	-	√
8	Ashmore Saham Sejahtera Nusantara	0.1461	-2.2270	0.0073	√	-	√
9	Eastspring Investments Value Discovery Kelas B	0.1978	-2.1460	0.0199	√	-	√
10	Manulife Dana Saham Kelas A	0.1303	-3.5563	0.0113	√	-	√
11	Batavia Saham Cemerlang	0.0716	-5.1965	0.0062	√	-	√
12	Sam Dana Cerdas	0.0554	-4.4604	0.0070	√	-	√
13	Batavia Saham Sejahtera	0.0715	-5.2020	0.0062	√	-	√
14	Sucorinvest Equity Fund	0.2223	-3.6102	0.0080	√	-	√
15	Sequis Equity Maxima	0.0508	-5.2451	0.0006	√	-	√
16	Trimegah Saham Nusantara	0.0894	-5.3398	0.0061	√	-	√
17	Danareksa Mawar Ekuitas Plus	0.0625	-5.1348	-0.0007	√	-	-
18	Hoam Smart Beta Ekuitas	0.1463	-4.3535	0.0134	√	-	√
19	Syailendra Dana Ekuitas Sejahtera	0.0322	-3.7326	-0.0041	√	-	-
20	Manulife Dana Saham Andalan	0.2729	-0.2330	0.0188	√	-	√
21	Simas Saham Unggulan	-0.1248	-1.2657	-0.0097	-	-	-
22	Schroder 90 Plus Equity Fund	0.0871	-2.3561	0.0004	√	-	√
23	Bahana Primavera 99 Kelas S	0.0340	-5.1296	0.0013	√	-	√
24	BNP Paribas Pesona	0.0759	-3.9909	0.0070	√	-	√
25	BNP Paribas Ekuitas	0.0758	-3.9382	0.0055	√	-	√
26	BNI-AM Inspiring Equity Fund	0.0326	-6.1426	0.0075	√	-	√
27	BNP Paribas Maxi Saham	0.0417	-6.1284	0.0032	√	-	√
28	Panin Dana Maksima	0.0796	-3.1282	0.0017	√	-	√
29	Schroder Dana Prestasi Prima	0.0749	-3.5878	0.0007	√	-	√
30	Schroder Dana Istimewa	0.1875	-2.4895	0.0177	√	-	√
31	BNP Paribas Infrastruktur Plus	0.0674	-5.4752	0.0098	√	-	√
32	Capital Equity Fund	0.0130	12.8300	-0.0138	√	√	-
33	Bahana Stellar Equity Fund	0.0317	-3.4107	-0.0037	√	-	-
34	Mandiri Investa Atraktif	0.0901	-4.7161	0.0010	√	-	√
35	Sam Indonesian Equity Fund	0.2963	10.8225	0.1069	√	√	√
36	Ewd Asset Dividend Yield Equity Fund	0.0864	-3.1045	-0.0031	√	-	-
37	Danareksa Mawar Ekuitas Utama	0.0651	-5.1867	0.0008	√	-	√
38	BNP Paribas Solaris	0.2447	-2.3359	0.0165	√	-	√
39	Manulife Dana Ekuitas Utama	0.1419	-5.6932	0.0112	√	-	√
40	Mandiri Investa Cerdas Bangsa	0.0652	-3.9212	0.0015	√	-	√
41	Schroder Dana Ekuitas Utama	0.1308	-2.3703	0.0061	√	-	√
42	Panin Dana Berkembang	0.1052	-4.7119	0.0049	√	-	√
43	Ashmore Saham Sejahtera Nusantara II	0.1032	-3.7680	0.0058	√	-	√
44	Panin Dana Teladan	0.1590	-0.6648	0.0147	√	-	√
45	Trimegah Bhakti Bangsa	0.1455	-4.5553	0.0137	√	-	√
46	Tram Consumption Plus	0.1058	-6.0054	0.0103	√	-	√
47	Pan Arcadia Dana Saham Bertumbuh	0.4709	23.2547	-0.0585	√	√	-
48	Ashmore Saham Dinamis Nusantara	0.2299	-2.5171	0.0169	√	-	√
49	Pinnacle Dana Prima	0.3409	8.4968	-0.0283	√	√	-
50	Syailendra Equity Garuda Fund	0.0939	-3.0738	0.0053	√	-	√
51	Mandiri Dynamic Equity	0.2516	-6.9340	0.0363	√	-	√
52	Panin Dana Berdedikasi	0.0443	-6.3179	0.0052	√	-	√
53	Bahana Dana Ekuitas Andalan	0.0357	-5.2229	0.0024	√	-	√
54	Mandiri Investa Equity Movement	0.0756	-4.7041	0.0001	√	-	√
55	Pool Advista Kapital Optimal	0.3381	13.8990	-0.0444	√	√	-
	Average & Good Performance Percentage	0.1221	-2.2563	0.0056	54	5	45
					98.18%	9.09%	81.82%

Source: calculated by STATA 16.