SIDAK - Universita	as Mulawarman 🗙 🖺 An	alytical and Bioanalytic	al Elect × +	100						
$\leftrightarrow$ d $\Delta$	A Not secure   abech	em.com/author?_ac	tion=processed						☆	Paused :
Su	Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry         Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry         Submit Manuscript       Hore       Journal Info       Editorial Board       Archiv       Contact Us       Anan Sentosa Panggabar       Log									
#	Manuscript ID	Manuscript Type	Manuscript Title	Submit Date	Current Status	Modify Date	Manuscript Main File	Email	Withdraw	
1	ABEC2020-2009-1092	Original Article	PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE Pb(II) BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR	2020-09-10	Manuscript Handled by Technical Editor	2020-09-19	÷		•	
This website uses	cookies to ensure you get	t the best experienc	e on our website.							Got it!

## Acknowledgement of Submission (#ABEC2020-2009-1092)

Sep 10, 2020 at 6:12 PM PrintRaw message

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry <journal@iranjournals.ir> To: amanspanggabean@yahoo.com Cc: abechem@gmail.com

Manuscript ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092

#### Manuscript Title: **PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE Pb(II) BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR**

Authors: Aman Panggabean

#### Dear Dr. Aman Sentosa Panggabean

This is to acknowledge receiving the above mentioned manuscript.

The manuscript will be reviewed for possible publication in the Scientific Journal Management System.

Please be sure that the submitted manuscript has not been published previously and will not be submitted elsewhere prior to our decision.

Our editorial decision will be brought to your attention once the paper has been reviewed by referees considerations.

Thank you for choosing ABEC to present your work.

Best regards,

Editoral Team of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

-	(8,369 unread) - amanspanggabea	× 🗎 Analytical and Bioanalytical Electro: × 🕓 WhatsApp × +			~	_	.8×						
<del>:</del>	С 🍙 🌔	A https://www.abechem.com/author?_action=info&manuscript=136240	☆		: III\ 🗉	) එ	=						
	Analyti	cal and Bioanalytical Electrochemist		***		1							
	Home Journal Info <del>-</del>	Editorial Board Submit Manuscript Archive + Contact Us	Aman Sentosa Par	nggabean	Logout								
	My Home / Author / Manuscript Information												
	B 8 G												
	Manuscript Information	Authors Files											
	Manuscript ID	ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)											
	Manuscript Title	PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BAS	ED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICA	L SENSO	R								
	Manuscript Type	Original Article											
	Section												
	Main Subjects	Potentiometry - Offered Subjects: Ion Selective Electrode											
is web	osite uses cookies to ensur	e you get the best experience on our website.				Got it!							
rt	🗎 🖸 😺 🛃			IN	P (7 d	19:38 26/06/20	023						
-	(8,369 unread) - amanspanggabea	X 🗎 Analytical and Bioanalytical Electro: X 🕓 WhatsApp X +			~		- 8						
$\rightarrow$	С @ (	A https://www.abechem.com/author?_action=info&manuscript=136240	<del>ت</del> ک	. ⊻	: III\ 🗉	) රු	≡						
	Main Subjects	Potentiometry - Offered Subjects: Ion Selective Electrode											
	ier has be as doped of the gro- e is a shif bear. The as 29.5 m <sup>2</sup> an be used of Pb2+ ic	een done. using 1M roup from ft of wave result of V/decade d within 6 ons in the											
Keywords ISE, PVC, Membrane, Dithizone, Pb2+, Nernstian slope.													
	Submit Date	2020-09-10 14:42:41											
	Revise Date	2021-12-03 08:19:39											
	Accept Date	2021-12-31											
	View Published Article	Volume 13, Issue 3 https://www.abechem.com/article_248523.html											
Author's Comment     Hopely can be published in this journal.       Comments for Author     Manuscript Published (Online)													
	Modify Date	2022-01-01 01:17:57				~							
nis web	osite uses cookies to ensur	e you get the best experience on our website.				Got it!							
art [	lo 🍯 😡			IN	₽₿₫	19:38	3 023						

# Manuscript Needs Major Revision (#ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1))

Nov 19, 2021 at 7:33 PM PrintRaw message

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry <no-reply@sinaweb.net> To: amanspanggabean@yahoo.com

Manuscript ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092

#### Manuscript Title: **PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE Pb(II) BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR**

Authors: Aman Panggabean

#### Dear Dr. Aman Sentosa Panggabean

Evaluation process of the above mentioned manuscript has been done. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended Major Revisions. In this case we normally treat it as unacceptable for publication. However, as numerous editorial errors have pointed out by the reviewers, the **Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry** editor believes that the manuscript could be rectified and prepare for possible publication.

Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s) comments and revise your manuscript as soon as possible.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to journal, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision in a reasonable amount of time (3 weeks), we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Best regards,

#### Editorial Team of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

Reviewer 1

The manuscript explains a lead ion selective electrode based on a DITHIZONE a sensing material. As literature survey shows this compound are also utilized in spectroscopic determination of lead ions.

Although the authors done many experimental tests, the presented data and written text is a little bit weak. So, the manuscript needs a serious revising then it will be considered again.

The comments which should be addressed are as follow:

1- The research highlight or novelty of this work should be compared with previous reported lead potentiometric sensors. In term of linear range, detection limit, or even selectivity it seems a weaker work. The authors should explain more about superiority of their work in introduction.

2- Why there is a need to such a lead ISE?

3- The Kf of dithizone and lead is a too for potentiometric sensor, how the authors explain it? Such Kf causes a long response time!

4- It would be better chemical structure of Dithizone and its complexation with lead is provided.

5- Why was the interference of anions such as chloride and sulphate studied? If anions are important why some of cations were used in form of acetate and some nitrate or chloride! It would be better the same anions used in all case.

6- The interference of lead ions is generally Hg and Ag. Why did they not be studied?

7- Condition time 7 days!!!!! It too long!!!! Maximum 24h is acceptable. Such time affect the reusability of the electrode.

8- Why internal solution was filled with Pb(NO3)2 1 M, firstly it would be better PbCl2 to interact with internal reference electrode and then the concentration of too high and potential drift during low concentration due to the diffusion occurred. May be due to this procedure the detection limit could not goes to lower amount.

9- Where is the cell assembly? It should be provided.

10- "The equipment used in this research are beaker glass, volumetric pipet, dropper, cylinder, volumetric flask, funnel" these are not instrument which the authors stated in instrumentation part!!!!!! They are general lab tools which should be removed from the text! Instead, the type and model of other used instruments or apparatus should be stated. Especially the type of reference electrode and working electrode.

11- "...The membrane Pb2+-DTZ was affixed with glue to the electrode ..." which kind of electrode?!!! Which type of ISE was used?

12- How the authors optimized the membrane compositions?

13- Which plasticizer were used or why?

14- Fig. 1 is unclear. High resolution figure should be provided.

15- Fig. 2 is not presented scientifically! The guide lines should be removed. Why two linear range is shown!!!!! Why just 4 concentrations in linear range are shown!!!? More concentration should be tested for a precis curve.

16- Fig. 3 is wrong. Due to the used concentration and the Ksp of Pb(OH)2 it is not possible to have Pb2+ ions in alkaline pH even in pH 6!!!! Explanation is too weak.

17- Fig. 4 is also not reported in scientific presentation. Delete guide lines and change the scale to see the difference better. Also Fig. 5, change the scale of Y axis.

18- There is no real sample analysis!!!! It should be provided.

19- Accuracy of the proposed sensor should be tested by a reference method.

20- Figures of merit, error bars, standard deviation and validity of the electrode are not reported such as reproducibility, repeatability and ...

21- Conclusion is too weak!!!

22- The references list is too old. There are many newer works in recent years which the authors did not consider them. They should be updated.

23- A comparison table should be provided.

24- And the last the English of the text should be revised carefully. Some examples of grammatically errors or badly worded: "ISE Pb2+" should be "the Pb2+ ISE" or "Nernstian factor" should be "Nernstian slope" or "membranes was removed" should be "membranes were removed" or "membrane DTZ" should be "membrane contained DTZ".

#### **Response to Reviewer**

## Title of Manuscript : PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR

We have corrected several things that have been requested by reviewers to be improved in our manuscript

:

1. Several Journal and literature has been added in the introduction to reinforce why  $Pb^{2+}$  ISE was conducted.

2. Chemical structure of Dithizone and its complexation with lead has been added in the result and discussion at fig. 2.

3. Ag<sup>+</sup> has been used as interference ion of  $Pb^{2+}$  ISE.

4. The graphic scale in Fig. 2 and Fig. 3 has been fixed.

- 5. In this study, real sample analysis was not carried out, only characterizes the  $Pb^{2+}$  ESI made whether it is suitable to be used as an alternative as analysis methode for determination  $Pb^{2+}$  in the samples.
- 6. The conclusions in this article are adjusted to the aims and results of this research.
- 7. Some examples of grammatically errors: "ISE Pb2+" should be "the Pb2+ ISE" or "Nernstian factor" should be "Nernstian slope" or "membranes was removed" should be "membranes were removed" or "membrane DTZ" should be "membrane contained DTZ", has been corrected.

Thanks for your antention,

#### Aman Sentosa Panggabean

## Acknowledgement of Revision (#ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1))

Dec 3, 2021 at 12:49 PM PrintRaw message

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry <no-reply@sinaweb.net> To: amanspanggabean@yahoo.com Cc: abechem@gmail.com

Manuscript ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)

#### Manuscript Title: **PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR**

Authors: Aman Panggabean

Date: 2020-09-10

#### Dear Dr. Aman Sentosa Panggabean

Thank you for submitting the revised file of your manuscript to the **Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry** 

The Editorial Office will proceed on your manuscript and inform you in the earliest time.

If there is anything else, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Truly yours,

Executive Managing Director of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

# Scientific Acceptation of Manuscript (#ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1))

Dec 29, 2021 at 6:37 PM PrintRaw message

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry <no-reply@sinaweb.net> To: amanspanggabean@yahoo.com

Manuscript ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)

#### Manuscript Title: **PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR**

Authors: Aman Panggabean

#### Dear Dr. Aman Sentosa Panggabean

I am pleased to inform you that after technical and peer-review evaluations, the above mentioned manuscript has been **accepted** for publication in the journal of **Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry**.

The proof of your manuscript will be sent to you soon for a final check.

Best regards,

Mohammad Reza Ganjali

Editor-in-Chief of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

# Review the proofs of your article in Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry (#ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1))

Dec 31, 2021 at 11:39 PM PrintRaw message

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry <no-reply@sinaweb.net> To: amanspanggabean@yahoo.com

Manuscript ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)

#### Manuscript Title: **PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR**

Authors: Aman Panggabean

#### Dear Dr. Aman Sentosa Panggabean,

We are pleased to inform you that your paper is nearing publication. The page proof is ready and attached.

Please check it carefully and send us any corrections and responses to the queries (if any) or your approval to publish the article without change within 2 days.

If there is no query and your confirmation are not received on time, we assume that you have not any correction and the proof will be published as it is.

Please note that once we receive your corrections or confirmation, your article is considered finalized and further amendments are no longer possible.

In case of any difficulty with the proof, please contact us.

We hope you are pleased with the publication.

Best regards,

Editorial Office of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

۵	3) 🛏	3,369 unread) - amanspanggabe $_{\circ} imes$	Analytical an	d Bioanalytical Electroc 🗙	🚫 WhatsApp		× +					~	
$\leftarrow$	$\rightarrow$	C @ 0	https://ww	w.abechem.com/autho	r?_action=decisio	n				\$	$\bigtriangledown$		മ ≡
		Analytica	land	Bioanal	ytical I	Electr	ochen Since 20	nistry 009 by CEE					î
	H	lome Journal Info <del>-</del> Ee	ditorial Board	Submit Manuscrip	t Archive <del>-</del>	Contact Us				Aman Sento	sa Panggabea	n Logout	
	N #	fy Home / Author / Submiss	ions with a De	cision Manuscript Title	_	Submit Date	Current	Modify Date	Email	Manuscript	Acceptance	Publish	
	"	Manascript ib	Туре	manuscript rite		Submit Dute	Status	would bac	Linui	Main File	Certificate	Certificate	
	1	ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)	Original Article	PREPARATION AN CHARACTERIZATION ION SELECTIVE EI BASED ON DITHIZ CHEMICAL SENSO	D DN OF Pb(II) LECTRODE ONE AS IR	2020-09-10	Manuscript Published (Online)	2022-01-01		*	<b></b>		
			1	·		-		·		1			
Thi	s webs	site uses cookies to ensure yo	u get the best	experience on our we	bsite.							G	<mark>ot it!</mark>
A <b>7</b> Star	t [	🗐 💿 😺 👧									IN 🗍	P C al	19:39 26/06/2023 💻

Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry - Author - Acceptance Cer...

## Article Acceptance Certificate

This certificate confirms that the following paper has been accepted for publication in Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

Title: PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)

Authors: Aman Panggabean

Submit Date: 10 September 2020 Accept Date: 31 December 2021

Prof. Mohammad Reza Ganjali Editor-in-Chief of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry

## Article Acceptance Certificate

This certificate confirms that the following paper has been accepted for publication in Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry, Volume 13, Issue 3

Title: PREPARATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF Pb(II) ION SELECTIVE ELECTRODE BASED ON DITHIZONE AS CHEMICAL SENSOR ID: ABEC2020-2009-1092 (R1)

Authors: Aman Panggabean

Submit Date: 10 September 2020 Accept Date: 31 December 2021 Publish Date: 01 December 2021

Prof. Mohammad Reza Ganjali Editor-in-Chief of Analytical and Bioanalytical Electrochemistry