

REVIEWER'S COMMENTS

Title of the article reviewed:

What Driving Gross Domestic Product of Agriculture: Lessons from Indonesia (2014 – 2021)

Summary

This paper evaluating the factors driving the GDP of agriculture in Indonesia. Data duration is 2014 – 2021. The construction of the analysis is framed by linear regression. It was found that employment in agriculture, precipitation, arable land, crop production, food production, livestock production, and fertilizer have a simultaneous impact on GDP of agriculture. Then, employment in agriculture, precipitation, food production, livestock production, and fertilizer have a partial impact on the GDP of Agriculture. Unfortunately, arable land and crop production do not have a partial impact on the GDP of Agriculture. Long-term prospects consider dimensions that are not influential to be developed holistically. Another point is also considering the GDP of agriculture in a more competitive exploration.

Major Issues

The actual significance and contribution of the article is not reflected, so it is suggested that the author add such elaboration. There are some problems in the data analysis section, such as questioning the hypothesis setting. It is suggested that the author make proper use of the data and make full analysis. Some conclusions lack strong support, and suggest the author add necessary elaboration.

Comment [i-1]: Scientific work contributions are added to the abstract. Regarding data analysis related to setting the hypothesis based on unit variables, it has been included in the sub-chapter: 2.3. In addition, the interpretation of the discussion and the phenomena of the findings are also included in the conclusions.

Abstract:

- The abstract section does not write the theoretical contribution and practical significance of the article, which is an important part of the article, and the author is advised to highlight the focus appropriately.
- It is recommended that the contributions, innovations, future research directions and limitations of this paper should be included at the end of the abstract.

Comment [i-2]: The practical significance and academic benefits for literature and policy development have been revised for inclusion in the abstract. It also includes limitations of the paper for more constructive and relevant future research directions.

Introduction:

- The introduction to the background is too simple, and the existing literature cannot establish the overall connection between the research content and the academic community.
- The problem description is not clear enough, so it is suggested that the author add necessary elaboration and simplify the irrelevant narrative.

Comment [i-3]: Arguments that describe the narrative of the problem and build links between theoretical gaps and study content are added explicitly in the introduction.

Methodology:

Comment [i-4]: Corrections in research methods include: (1) hypothesis projections or assumptions are interpreted based on factors that influence the GPP of agriculture and (2) hypotheses have been articulated in a complex manner to facilitate statistical notation and reduce long-winded explanations.

Regarding the first and second recommendations, the parameters in the variable indicators are summarized in Table 1. Then, the variable labels that refer to the spacing between words in paragraphs are absolute symbols. Statistically, the attributes on the symbols use the standard equation format from Ms. word. That way, authors can't follow the suggestions of anonymous reviewers.

- It is suggested that the author show the parameters in the form of a table for readers to view.
- Some parameters lead to the distance between the words in the paragraph, so it is suggested that the author pay attention to details and aesthetics.
- It should be assumed in the first mentioned part, not at the end of the chapter.
- The assumption of H₀ only needs to write out one situation, or to refuse or accept it.

Results :

- Assuming that H₀ should represent only one scenario, while the authors believe that "only H₀ for food production and livestock production is denied", this part of the expression confounds the concepts and scenarios of assumptions, if needed, suggesting the authors to add necessary assumptions and scenarios.
- Part 3.2 mainly focuses on the views and views of other countries and other scholars and other books on agricultural production, and the suggestions are closely related to the research results of this paper.

Comment [i-[5]: The reviewer's comments regarding the proposed null hypothesis (H₀) or the alternative hypothesis (H_a) are corrected. There seems to be an error in writing the hypotheses assumptions. The authors realized that and we fixed it.

Discussion:

- Part of the inference is not supported by strong arguments, and there is a suspicion of one-sided interpretation.

Conclusion:

- The conclusion chapter describes the innovation of the article research, which is necessary, but the judgment is not strongly supported, so it is suggested to add necessary discussion.
- The authors propose seven factors affecting agricultural GDP in Indonesia, but in one of the factors, precipitation, the dry and rainy seasons in Indonesia were not discussed, and the dry season lasted for 7 months. We suggest that this special situation should be discussed earlier in the article to increase the professionalism of the article.

Comment [i-[6]: Statistical inferences on the actual findings are not fully supported or contradicted by previous publications. Given that there are proposed hypotheses that are accepted or vice versa in the empirical results, the literature debate is poured into sub-chapters: 3.2. justification.

Comment [i-[7]: The assessment of the research output is strengthened in a new paragraph at the conclusion. This special paragraph aims to understand the situation about whether the GDP of agriculture can be increased or decreased when channeled by independent variables.

General Comments

Finally, I hereby recommend that this article be accepted and be considered for publication after major corrections.