

[IJEEP] Submission Acknowledgement**Editor in Chief** <editor@econjournals.com>

Sun, Oct 13, 2019 at 10:44 AM

To: Abdunnur <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.od>

Abdunnur:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://econjournals.com/index.php/technium/about/submissions>

Username: abdunnur

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

Publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **100 EURO.**

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy

[IJEEP] Revision requestEditor in Chief editor@econjournals.com

Mon, Nov 04, 2019 at 12:02 PM

To: Abdunnur <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.id>

Abdunnur:

The paper "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" has been preliminarily reviewed.

Reviewers have given their comments on your paper. Please do the following when you resubmit your revised version:

- (i) All corrections as per the reviewers' comments and prepare a table / response letter showing corrections done. Your corrections will not be accepted in the absence of this response letter / table.
- (ii) All authors' names, emails and affiliations checked and corrected

Please ensure the submission of the revision within 1 month of receiving this mail either both as a reply to this mail and in the online system.

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements, and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

[International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy](#)

Reviewer A

The novelty of the study is also highlighted in the abstract, emphasizing that this study is the first to examine the joint effect of the mentioned variables on the ecological footprint in Indonesia. This indicates that the study is making a significant contribution to the existing literature in this area.

1. The study appears to make a valuable contribution to the literature on the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. However, there are some drawbacks and suggestions which must be overcome and incorporated by the authors.
2. The introduction should present the problem of the increasing ecological burden resulting from the world's population growth, densification, and human activities such as urbanization, fisheries, and agriculture. The authors must highlight the insufficient knowledge regarding the distinction between natural and human-altered changes in marine habitat, which contributes to ambiguity in the impact of fishery produce on marine life and natural habitat. The paper should also argue that the increasing demand for fish due to the expanding population and changing dietary inclinations has created a strain on fisheries sustainability. The author must also discuss the effects of agriculture and urbanization on environmental stability and their relationship with ecological footprints (EFs). Finally, the paper must present the clear objective of examining the link between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and environment and their joint effect on EF in Indonesia, given its massive population, marine-centred location, and almost equal rural-urban ratio.
3. The literature review provides an overview of several studies that have investigated the impact of

various factors on the environment, including urbanization, agriculture, energy consumption, trade liberalization, output, and fisheries. The studies have used different data sets and statistical techniques to measure environmental degradation, and the findings are mixed. Some studies found that urbanization has a positive impact on environmental degradation, while others found a negative or insignificant association. Similarly, authors should present how the impact of agriculture on the environment is also mixed, with some studies reporting a positive impact on environmental degradation and others showing a negative association. They should also explain that the impact of energy consumption, output, and trade liberalization on the environment also varies depending on the region and the data set used.

4. In the methods sections, the authors should explain how they collected data from the World Development Indicators and used Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) and Philip Perron (PP) unit root tests to check for stationary properties for long haul connection of focused time series information.
5. The results should explain the findings linked with a strong long-term relationship between fisheries production, UD, agriculture production, and EF in Indonesia.

Reviewer B

This study investigates the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. The study uses a novel approach, the auto-regressive distributed lag (ARDL) bound testing cointegration methodology, to analyze the long- and short-term effects of these variables on Indonesia's ecological footprint (EF). The abstract provides a clear and concise overview of the study's objectives, methodology, and results. However, there are some limitations to the other parts of the study.

1. Firstly, the literature review highlights the complex relationship between economic development and environmental sustainability. However, it does not explain how much economic growth is essential for improving living standards. It also lacks evidence of how economic growth leads to increased environmental degradation. These points must be addressed to help policymakers to balance economic development with environmental protection to ensure sustainable development.
2. Secondly, it does not mention the sample size or data sources used in the study, which could impact the generalizability of the results. Additionally, it does not provide any information on the statistical significance of the findings or the effect sizes.
3. The results of the study are briefly summarized with the ARDL confirming a positive and significant impact of urban development, agriculture, and fisheries production on the ecological footprint in the long run. However, they should be teleoperated more. Also, results show that the short-run impact of agriculture production on the ecological footprint is negative, which needs more explanation.
4. Furthermore, the manuscript lacks information on the limitations of the study, potential confounding factors, and implications of the results. It would be useful to know how the study results could be interpreted in the context of other studies in the field and how the Indonesian government could implement the study recommendations.
5. Stuy must also conclude by suggesting that the Indonesian government needs to take action based on the study's findings without detailing what actions they are. It would be helpful to have more information on the specific policy recommendations and implications for sustainable development in Indonesia.
6. Overall, it is an interesting study that provides new insights into the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. However, more information is required to fully understand the study's contribution to the field and the implications of the findings for policymakers and practitioners.

[IJEEP] Revision Submission Acknowledgement**Editor in Chief** <editor@econjournals.com>

Thu, Nov 28, 2019 at 09:31 AM

To: **Abdunnur** <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.od>

Abdunnur:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://econjournals.com/index.php/technium/about/submissions>

Username: abdunnur

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

Publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **100 EURO.**

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-A

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The novelty of the study is also highlighted in the abstract, emphasizing that this study is the first to examine the joint effect of the mentioned variables on the ecological footprint in Indonesia. This indicates that the study is making a significant contribution to the existing literature in this area.	Thanks a lot, dear reviewer. Your kind comments and suggestions helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	The study appears to make a valuable contribution to the literature on the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. However, there are some drawbacks and suggestions which must be overcome and incorporated by the authors.	Dear reviewer, by following your kind guidelines, Please see pages 6-12
2.	The introduction should present the problem of the increasing ecological burden resulting from the world's population growth, densification, and human activities such as urbanization, fisheries, and agriculture. The authors must highlight the insufficient knowledge regarding the distinction between natural and human-altered changes in marine habitat, which contributes to ambiguity in the impact of fishery produce on marine life and natural habitat. The paper should also argue that the increasing demand for fish due to the expanding population and changing dietary inclinations has created a strain on fisheries sustainability. The author must also discuss the effects of agriculture and urbanization on environmental stability and their relationship with ecological footprints (EFs). Finally, the paper must present the clear objective of examining the link between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and environment and their joint effect on EF in Indonesia, given its	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, we present the problem of the increasing ecological burden resulting from the world's population growth, densification, and human activities such as urbanization, fisheries, and agriculture Please see page7 and 15

	massive population, marine-centred location, and almost equal rural-urban ratio.	
3	The literature review provides an overview of several studies that have investigated the impact of various factors on the environment, including urbanization, agriculture, energy consumption, trade liberalization, output, and fisheries. The studies have used different data sets and statistical techniques to measure environmental degradation, and the findings are mixed. Some studies found that urbanization has a positive impact on environmental degradation, while others found a negative or insignificant association. Similarly, authors should present how the impact of agriculture on the environment is also mixed, with some studies reporting a positive impact on environmental degradation and others showing a negative association. They should also explain that the impact of energy consumption, output, and trade liberalization on the environment also varies depending on the region and the data set used.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, done as suggested. Please see pages 7-10
4	In the methods sections, the authors should explain how they collected data from the World Development Indicators and used Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) and Philip Perron (PP) unit root tests to check for stationary properties for long haul connection of focused time series information.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested Please see table 1.
5	The results should explain the findings linked with a strong long-term relationship between fisheries production, UD, agriculture production, and EF in Indonesia.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind guidelines. We have now explained the findings linked with a strong long-term relationship between fisheries production, UD, agriculture production, and EF in Indonesia. Please see pages 17-19

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-B

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>This study investigates the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. The study uses a novel approach, the auto-regressive distributed lag (ARDL) bound testing cointegration methodology, to analyze the long- and short-term effects of these variables on Indonesia's ecological footprint (EF). The abstract provides a clear and concise overview of the study's objectives, methodology, and results. However, there are some limitations to the other parts of the study.</p>	<p>Thanks very much, dear reviewer.</p>
1	<p>Firstly, the literature review highlights the complex relationship between economic development and environmental sustainability. However, it does not explain how much economic growth is essential for improving living standards. It also lacks evidence of how economic growth leads to increased environmental degradation. These points must be addressed to help policymakers to balance economic development with environmental protection to ensure sustainable development.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, we have followed your kind guidelines and explained how much economic growth is essential for improving living standards and also added other parts as suggested.</p> <p>Please see pages 6-8</p>
2	<p>Secondly, it does not mention the sample size or data sources used in the study, which could impact the generalizability of the results. Additionally, it does not provide any information on the statistical significance of the findings or the effect sizes.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, we have mentioned the sample size or data sources used in the study, which could impact the generalizability of the results and also provided any information on the statistical significance of the findings or the effect sizes as suggested</p> <p>Please see pages 13-14</p>

3	The results of the study are briefly summarized with the ARDL confirming a positive and significant impact of urban development, agriculture, and fisheries production on the ecological footprint in the long run. However, they should be teleoperated more. Also, results show that the short-run impact of agriculture production on the ecological footprint is negative, which needs more explanation.	Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions and comments. Done. Please see pages 15-17
4	Furthermore, the manuscript lacks information on the limitations of the study, potential confounding factors, and implications of the results. It would be useful to know how the study results could be interpreted in the context of other studies in the field and how the Indonesian government could implement the study recommendations.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, we have now added information on the limitations of the study, potential confounding factors, and implications of the results and explained the results in contextual terms. Please see tables 14-17
5	The study must also conclude by suggesting that the Indonesian government needs to take action based on the study's findings without detailing what actions they are. It would be helpful to have more information on the specific policy recommendations and implications for sustainable development in Indonesia.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind remarks. Done as suggested.
6	Overall, it is an interesting study that provides new insights into the relationship between fisheries, agriculture, urbanization, and the environment in Indonesia. However, more information is required to fully understand the study's contribution to the field and the implications of the findings for policymakers and practitioners.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind comments. Now we have strengthened the implications part as suggested. Please see pages 20-21

[IJEEP] Revision request**Editor in Chief** editor@econjournals.com

Mon, Dec 16, 2019 at 11:50 AM

To: Abdunnur <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.id>

Abdunnur:

The paper "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" has been reviewed again.

Here are some more suggestions for the authors to improve the paper's quality to make it worth reading.

- i. The authors should explain the use of the auto regressive distributed lag (ARDL) procedure of long-run affiliation, presented by Pesaran and Pesaran, to examine the relationship among different variables.
- ii. The authors must critically review a research paper's data estimation and interpretation. They should also explain the way of using the stationary test to confirm the stationary properties of the variables and two unit root tests to affirm the stationary character of the components.
- iii. The discussion section could be improved by providing a more detailed discussion of the results' implications and how they can be used to inform policy decisions.

Please ensure the submission of the revision within 1 month of receiving this mail either both as a reply to this mail and in the online system.

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements, and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

[International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy](#)

[IJEEP] Revision Submission Acknowledgement**Editor in Chief** <editor@econjournals.com>

Mon, Jan 06, 2020 at 09:01 AM

To: Abdunnur <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.od>

Abdunnur:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://econjournals.com/index.php/technium/about/submissions>

Username: abdunnur

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

Publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **100 EURO.**

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	Here are some more suggestions for the authors to improve the paper's quality to make it worth reading.	Once again, many thanks. We have now revised the manuscript to meet your kind requirements.
1.	The authors should explain the use of the autoregressive distributed lag (ARDL) procedure of long-run affiliation, presented by Pesaran and Pesaran, to examine the relationship among different variables.	Dear reviewer, done as per your kind suggestion. Please see pages 3-4
2.	The authors must critically review a research paper's data estimation and interpretation. They should also explain the way of using the stationary test to confirm the stationary properties of the variables and two unit root tests to affirm the stationary character of the components.	Following your kind guidelines, done. Please see pages 7-12
3	The discussion section could be improved by providing a more detailed discussion of the results' implications and how they can be used to inform policy decisions.	Dear reviewer, we have now improved the discussion as suggested. Please see pages 18-20

[IJEEP] Acceptance Acknowledgment**Editor in Chief** <editor@econjournals.com>

Thu Jan 23, 2020 at 10:16 AM

To: Abdunnur <abdunnur67@yahoo.co.od>

Abdunnur:

Congratulations!

Your paper entitled "Nexus of Fisheries and Agriculture Production and Urbanization on Ecological Footprint: New Evidence from Indonesian Economy" has been accepted for publication in the International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy (Vol. 10 No. 3, 2020).

Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, and so on. We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Note:

We will send you an email separately for the publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and database indexing costs): 100 EURO.

Editor in Chief

[International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy](#)