JURNAL

by Jurnal_pa Rudi Agung N Buat Gb_3

Article in Press

Biosaintifika 10 (3) (2018) XXX-XXX

Biosaintifika

Journal of Biology & Biology Education

http://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/biosaintifika

Growth and Survival Evaluation of Oreochromis Sp fed *Hermetia illucens* Larva and *Manihot esculenta leaves* Meal

✉**Nur Aini**[1], **Rudy Agung Nugroho**[2], **Nova Hariani**[3]

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.15294/biosaintifika.v10i3.15278

[1]Animal Physiology, Development, and Molecular Laboratory, Department of Biology,
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Universitas Mulawarman, Indonesia
[2] Ecology and Animal Systematic Laboratory, Department of Biology,
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Universitas Mulawarman, Indonesia

History Article

Received 31 July 2018
Approved 19 September 2018
Published 31 December 2018

Keywords

Feed efficiency; Growth; *Hermetia illucens; Manihot esculenta*; *Oreochromis sp*

Abstract

This study was conducted to compare the effects of dietary substitution of fish meal (FM) with black soldier fly (*Hermetia illucens*) larvae meal (BSFM) and *Manihot esculenta* leaves meal (MEM) on the growth and feed efficiency of *Oreochromis* sp. Four concentrations *viz*: P1 (25%): 50g BSFM and 25g MEM, P2 (50%): 100g BSFM and 50g MEM, P3 (75%): 150g BSFM and 75g MEM, P4 (100%): 200g BSFM and 100g MEM were prepared and tested against control without FM replacement. Each diet was fed to three replicates groups of fish at a rate of 5% of body weight two times per day for 30 days. At the end of the trial, growth parameters, Feed conversion rate (FCR), and feed efficiency (FE) were evaluated. The results showed that fish fed dietary substitution of FM with combination ratio of BSFM and MEM higher than 50% significantly improved all growth parameters, FCR and FE. It is therefore suggested that the partial (higher than 50%) or total replacement of fish meal with combination of BSFM and MEM in the diet of *Oreochromis* sp can be used as fish meal substitution to obtain better growth and feed efficiency.

How to Cite

Aini, N., Nugroho, R. A., & Hariani, N. (2018). Growth and Survival Evaluation of Oreochromis Sp fed *Hermetia illucens* Larva and *Manihot esculenta leaves* Meal. *Biosaintifika: Journal of Biology & Biology Education*, 10(3), XXX-XXX.

✉ Correspondence Author:
Jl. Barong Tongkok No 4, Gn Kelua, Samarinda, East Kalimantan, Indonesia
E-mail: rudysatriana@yahoo.com

p-ISSN 2085-191X
e-ISSN 2338-7610

INTRODUCTION

Recently, the global production of tilapia has reached 5.000.000 metric tons, placing this sector in the second largest aquaculture in the world (Fitzsimmons, 2016). As one of the pivotal species in Indonesia aquaculture, the production of tilapia has also enhanced gradually in some Indonesia's region such as South Sumatera, West Java and East Kalimantan (Arisanti et al., 2013). In addition, the enhancing market demand of tilapia has triggered research about nutrition in order to boost productivity and health performance.

Nutrition in aquaculture is a high cost component, particularly in intensive culture. Reaching over 50% of operating budget. Protein as one of the important nutrients provides amino acids which is required for building new tissue and/or replacing old tissues. The protein component alone in fish diets represents about 50% of feed cost in intensive culture (Kordi, 2010). The research conducting the use of protein from insect as a promising foodstuff for animal has been done for almost 40 years ago. However, the supplementation of protein from insect as aquafeed has not been widely explored by researchers. The protein from insect can be considered as a substitution of fish meal (FM) because of environmentally friendly and has high protein and lipid (Hanief et al., 2014; Khosravi et al., 2015; Sumiati et al., 2006; Tang et al., 2009). Past research on the substitution of protein from insect in aquafeed is very limited. Nevertheless, over the last few years, the interest of protein insect as aquafeed has enhanced, and many feeding trials have been done at many kinds of fish both in carnivorous and herbivorous or even omnivorous fish. Previous studies revealed that the supplementation of low cost reference diets for fish has been done using protein from whole or parts of insect which is transformed into an insect protein meal (AOAC, 1990; Effendi et al., 2006; Iskandar, 2015), for example yellow mealworm (*Tenebrio molitor*) (Setiawati, 2008). Tough the adult's stage of insect may not consider to be applied in feeds as they contain quinones; the larvae stage of insect has a high nutritional value, containing high protein and lipids, but low in ash (Craig & Helfrich, 2002).

Previous study on the larvae of *T. molitor* (TM) revealed that the larvae can be potentially used as a meal (Craig & Helfrich, 2002; Setiawati, 2008) and recently being produced at a huge industrial scale in China (Boyd, 1998). The TM can be able to be used either partial replacement in fish feed by sun-dried or full replacement. Some past research regarding insect meal substitution have been also done in some fish such as African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) (SNI, 2015); *Ameiurus melas* (Roncarati et al., 2014a; Roncarati et al., 2014b), rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) (Gasco et al., 2014). The substitution FM with larvae *T. molitor* at level 20% found to be a positive effect on the growth of African catfish and resulted a significant enhancement in comparing with fish without substitution (Gasco et al., 2014). Another study, however, revealed that substitution FM with TM at a high levels between 80 and 100% resulted to decrease fish growth performance, feed and protein efficiency (Ng et al., 2001). In addition, the use of TM meal to replace of 100% of FM significantly reduced fish growth performances in comparison with 50% replacement of FM (Roncarati et al., 2014a; Roncarati et al., 2014b).

Another insect that potentially can be use as FM substitution is larvae of Black Soldier (*Hermetia illucens*). The Black soldier fly larvae in the form of meal (BSFM) is also potentially used to replace FM in diets for some fish such as European seabass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) (Magalhães et al., 2017); Yellow catfish (*Pelteobagrus fulvidraco*) (Hu et al., 2017); and juvenile Jian carp (*Cyprinus carpio* var. Jian) (Li et al., 2017). The BSFM is valuable ingredient, low cost, and has similar protein value, approximately 36-48% (Hu et al., 2017).

Besides protein source from larva, leaves of cassava (*Manihot esculenta*) can be also made as meal (MEM) to substitute FM. Leaves of cassava as high protein from 22,6 to 30%(Syahrizal et al., 2017). Past study stated that the growth of *Clarias gariepinus* was optimum after fed 25% inclusion in the fish diet (Odo et al., 2016). In contrary, Aride *et al.* (2016) found that diet for Tambaqui (*Colossoma macropomum*) consisting of 30% cassava reduced weight gain and specific growth rate.

Growth statues are a major parameter tool in aquatic management to evaluate growth performance of cultured fish. The ingredient in the aquafeed is one of the most important factors influencing the ability of cultured fish to exhibit its genetic potential for growth (Ali et al., 2015). Growth statues can be evaluated by calculating weight gain, body weight gain (BWG), daily weight gain (DWG), average weekly gain (AWG), specific growth rate (SGR), thermal growth coefficient (TGC), and Length gain which are the simplest parameters to determine the growth statues of fish (Busacher et al., 1990; Nur et al., 2017; Yusup & Nugroho, 2017). Besides growth parameters, feed efficiency (FC) and food conversion ratio (FCR) are also important tools to determine the effectiveness of the diets. (Ali et al., 2015). The FCR is a measure of an animal's efficiency in converting feed mass into body mass.

Although the research regarding the effects of FM replacement with protein from insect larva and MEM in the diet on some fish has been done, the role of the effects of BSFM in combination with MEM on the growth statues and feed efficiency of tilapia (*Oreochromis* sp) is limited know. Thus, the aim of the current research was to evaluate the growth statues including BWG, DWG, AWG, SGR, TGC, Length gain, and feed efficiency of tilapia after fed FM replacement with TM and MEM.

METHODS

Black Soldier Fly and *Manihot esculenta* meal preparation

Collected BSF larva were sacrificed by freezing (Finke et al., 1989) and immediately dried in an oven at 60°C for 20 h. The BSF larva were powdered using manual grinding machine. The resulting powder was packed and stored in a dark room before being used as a test diet. To prepare *Manihot esculenta* meal (MEM), leaves of cassava were washed and soaked for 24h to eliminate HCN. The leaves were then cut into small pieces and dried using oven at 60°C until dried. The dried leaves were then grinded to make a powder. The MEM was kept in the dark plastic and stored at 4°C until used as test diet.

Diet preparation

A control and tests diet were prepared to satisfy the nutrient requirements of *Oreochromis* sp. Five test diets were formulated as described in Table1. The test ingredients were partially replacement of FM with combination ratio of BSFM and MEM at levels 25(P1), 50(P2), 75(P3), and 100%(P4). The control diet (0%): was a diet without BSFM and MEM, P1 (25%): 50g BSFM and 25g MEM, P2 (50%): 100g BSFM and 50g MEM, P3 (75%): 150g BSFM and 75g MEM, P4 (100%): 200g BSFM and 100g MEM All test feed ingredients were obtained from commercial sources in Indonesia.

Diet proximate composition

Proximate composition of the diet was conducted according to the standard methods

Table 1. Composition of test diets used for experiment in tilapia, *Oreochromis* sp

Ingredients (%)	Groups				
	Control	P1	P2	P3	P4
Fish meal	30	22.5	15	7.5	0
Shrimp meal	20	20	20	20	20
Corn starch	10	10	10	10	10
Wheat grain	22.5	22.5	22.5	22.5	22.5
Tapioca flour	10	10	10	10	10
BSFM	0	5	10	15	20
MEM	0	2.5	5	7.5	10
Vitamin premix	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
Mineral premix	3	3	3	3	3
Corn oil	4	4	4	4	4
Moisture	1.65	1.59	1.68	1.09	1.27
Ash	9.2	9.24	9.13	9.71	10.23
Fat	15.33	17.05	16.7	17.44	17.54
Protein	30.21	26.59	23.58	24.49	29.56
Fiber	11.29	12.42	12.94	16.33	16.25
Carbohydrate	25.78	33.12	35.98	30.95	25.15

Note:All dry diet components, including vitamins and minerals mixture was thoroughly mixed with corn oil. Water was added, and the feed pressed into pellets of 1 mm diameter. The wet pellets were dried for 3 days at room temperature and stored at 4°C until use. Control (0%): without Black Soldier Fly Larva Meal (BSFM) and Cassava Leaves Meal (MEM), P1 (25%): 50g BSFM and 25g MEM, P2 (50%): 100g BSFM and 50g MEM, P3 (75%): 150g BSFM and 75g MEM, P4 (100%): 200g BSFM and 100g MEM described by the Association of Official Analytical Chemists: Moisture was determined by drying the samples in an oven (Behr, Germany) at 105 °C; Crude lipid was determined by chloroform methanol extraction (2:1, v/v); Crude protein was determined (Kjeldahl procedure: N x 6.25) using an automatic Kjeldahl system; Ash was measured by incineration in a muffle furnace at 500 °C for 6 h.

Animal and Experimental Setup

A total of 150 healthy tilapia (average initial weight ± 5 g; initial length ±7 cm) was stocked in the current experiment. All fish were acclimated in the laboratory for at least seven days. During the time of acclimatization fish fed on a commercial pellet diet twice per day (09:00, 17:00 GMT) at a rate of 5% body weight per day. The compositions of test diet are provided in Table 1. After acclimatization, fish were randomly divided into five groups. Each group consisted of three replicates of 10 fish per tank. The first group was fed on commercial-test diet (Control) and the remaining group were fed on test diets (P1-P4, ranging the replacement of FM from 25, 50, 75, to 100%) (Table1). The experiment was lasted for 30 days. Dissolved oxygen ($mg\,L^{-1}$) (Lutron DO-5509) and pH were monitored using a CyberScan pH 300 (Eutech Instruments, Singapore, China), temperature (°C) were monitored and measured by using routine thermometer every two days in each tank during the experimental period. Experimental tanks were regularly cleaned, and the fecal matters was siphoned out daily.

Growth Performance measurement

The weight of all fish from each tank was measured at initial and final day of the trial. After the feeding trial, the growth parameters including, final weight, body weight gain (BWG), daily weight gain (DWG), average weekly gain (AWG), specific growth rate (SGR), final length, length gain, daily length gain (DLG), Fulton condition and thermal growth coefficient (TGC). The TGC was calculated by using equation as follow:

TGC = x 100

where: W_t = weight of fish at the end of trial (g); W_0 = Initial weight (g)

To estimate feed efficiency, the parameter of feed conversion rate (FCR), and feed efficiency (FE) were also calculated. The BWG (g per fish), DWG, AWG ($g\,w^{-1}$), SGR (% g day-^{1}), and survival are calculated using equation as previously used by Wang (2007); (Yusuf & Nugroho, 2017); and Sang et al. (2011). The weight of each fish from each tank was measured using electronic balance (GX-4000, A&D Company, Ltd., Japan).AWG = [final weight (g) - initial weight (g)]/week. SGR = 100 x ([Ln(Wt) – Ln(Wo)]/d) where Wt and Wo are the weight of the fish at current time (t) and at the commencement of the experiment (0), d = Culture period (day), respectively. FCR= F/Wg, where FCR= feed conversion ratio, F= total of feed intake(g), Wg= weight gain during the study (g).The feed efficiency (FE)= (1/FCR) x 100 (Muchlisin et al., 2016).

Statistical Analysis

All data was statistically performed by using SPSS for Windows (Version 22) and expressed as mean ± SE (standard error). Percent data of survival was normalized using an arcsine transformation before performing significant differences analysis. The data was subjected to one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) to find any significant differences among various tested parameters. To determine the significant differences, Duncan's multiple range *post hoc* tests at a significance level of *P<0.05* was used.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

The growth parameters of fish fed the different substitution levels of FM with BSFM and MEM in the diets are shown in Table 2. Current findings stated that all growth parameters such as final weight , BWG, DWG, AWG, SGR, and TGC of fish fed diet with FM replacement higher than 50% were similar to fish control group without FM substitution. The BWG of fish fed total replacement FM in combination between 200 g BSFM and 100 g MEM showed the highest BWG (11.784±0.386). The final length, length gain, and Fulton condition of fish fed with FM substitution in combination of BSFM and MEM up to 100% also found better than fish without FM replacement. This result indicated that FM in the diet of *Oreochromis* sp can be partially or totally replaced by combination of BSFM and MEM.

Besides growth parameters, feed efficiency of fish fed FM replacement with BSFM and MEM higher than 50% also showed better FCR and FE (Table 3). The best FCR was obtained in the group of fish fed with total replacement of FM, containing 200g BSFM and 100g MEM. The FE also reached 56,89%, showing better than control group which only 43,95%. These findings also indicated that total substitution of FM with 200g BSFM and 100g MEM can be alternatively used to replaced FM in the diet of *Oreochromis* sp.

Table 2. Growth parameter of *Oreochromis* sp. fed dietary *Hermetia illucens* L. larvae meal and *Manihot esculenta* leaves meal as fish meal substitution for 30 days

Parameter	Groups				
	Control 0%	P1 (25%)	P2 (50%)	P3 (75%)	P4 (100%)
Initial weight (g)	4.722±0.087	3.140±0.095	3.223±0.093	3.761±0.155	3.862±0.171
Final weight (g)	15.095±0.529^{a}	12.181±0.389^{b}	12.023±0.468^{bc}	14.943±0.594^{acd}	15.647±0.509^{acd}
BWG (g/ fish)	10.373±0.480^{a}	9.041±0.313^{b}	8.800±0.388^{bc}	11.182±0.456^{acd}	11.784±0.386^{acd}
DWG (g/ fish)	0.371±0.017^{a}	0.323±0.011^{b}	0.314±0.014^{bc}	0.399±0.016^{acd}	0.421±0.014^{acd}
AWG (g/fish)	2.593±0.120^{a}	2.260±0.078^{b}	2.200±0.097^{bc}	2.796±0.114^{acd}	2.946±0.097^{acd}
SGR (%)	4.100±0.109^{a}	4.841±0.057^{b}	4.671±0.065^{bc}	4.932±0.060^{acd}	5.035±0.090^{abcd}
TGC	0.441±0.020^{a}	0.385±0.013^{b}	0.374±0.016^{bc}	0.477±0.019^{acd}	0.502±0.016^{abcd}
Initial length	6.992±0.076^{a}	6.323±0.088^{b}	6.114±0.079^{bc}	6.445±0.114^{bcd}	6.567±0.097^{bce}
Final length	9.589±0.128^{a}	8.797±0.143^{b}	8.855±0.132^{bc}	9.354±0.170^{acd}	9.655±0.141^{abcd}
Length gain	2.597±0.094^{a}	2.474±0.114^{b}	2.740±0.079^{ab}	2.908±0,086^{cd}	3.090±0.084^{cde}
DLG	0.087±0.003^{a}	0.082±0.004^{b}	0.091±0.003^{ab}	0.097±0.003^{cd}	0.103±0.003^{cd}
K	1.702±0.038^{a}	1.805±0.054^{b}	1.714±0.021^{ab}	1.822±0.036^{bcd}	1.736±0.033^{abc}

Note: Results were expressed as mean ± standard error. Different superscript alphabets in the same row indicate significantly different means *P<0.05* BWG = Body weight gain; DWG = Daily weight gain; AWG = Average weekly gain; SGR = Specific growth rate; TGC = Thermal growth coefficient, DLG = Daily length gain; K = Fulton condition. Control (0%): without black Soldier Larva Meal (BSFM) and Cassava Leaves Meal (MEM), P1 (25%): 50 g BSFM and 25 g MEM, P2 (50%): 100 g BSFM and 50 g MEM, P3 (75%): 150 g BSFM and 75 g MEM, P4 (100%): 200 g BSFM and 100 g MEM.

Table 3. Feed conversion ratio and feed efficiency of *Oreochromis* sp. fed different combination ratio of *Hermetia illucens* L. larvae and *Manihot esculenta* leaves meal for 30 days

Parameters	Groups				
	Control 0%	P1 (25%)	P2 (50%)	P3 (75%)	P4 (100%)
FCR	2.44±0.15^{a}	1.96±0.05^{b}	2.08±0.082^{ab}	1.93±0.06^{bc}	1.85±0.08^{bcd}
FE(%)	43.95±2.07^{a}	52.23±1.83^{b}	50.08±1.93^{ab}	53.36±2.07^{bc}	56.89±2.66^{bcd}

Note: Results were expressed as mean ± standard error. Different superscript alphabets in the same row indicate significantly different means *P<0.05*.FCR = Feed Conversion Ratioand FE = Feed Efficiency. Control (0%): without Black Soldier Fly Larva Meal (BSFM) and Cassava Leaves Meal (MEM), P1 (25%): 50g BSFM and 25g MEM, P2 (50%): 100g BSFM and 50g MEM, P3 (75%): 150g BSFM and 75g MEM, P4 (100%): 200g BSFM and 100g MEM.

One of the pivotal factors that need to be done in the aquafeed to enhance aquaculture extension is the acquisition and feed price (Moradi et al., 2013). Numerous scientist recommended different protein sources for the preparation of aquafeed to obtain maximum growth of fish (Kaushik & Troell, 2010; Metian, 2009; Radhakrishnan et al., 2016). Protein as a major ingredient in fish feed derives from FM which is highly digestible (up to 90%) and without or less anti-nutritional factors (ANFs) (Gatlin III et al., 2007). Nevertheless, the use of FM in the diet has increased cost of feed, not environmentally friendly, and competed with human need. Thus, the efforts to replace FM with other source protein either from animal or plant have been done and successfully conducted (Nugroho & Nur, 2018).

Present results stated that combination of BSFM and MEM to replace up to 100% of FM increased growth performance and feed efficiency. This result is similar to previous study revealed that replacement FM with Maggot meal-based diets compared favorably with fish meal-based diets and found to be no significant differences in the growth performance in African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) (Aniebo et al., 2018). Another study also found that the replacement of FM with prepupae BSFM in diets at level of 19.5% of HM to replace 45% of FM did not affect the growth performance of European seabass (*Dicentrarchus* *labrax*) (Magalhães et al., 2017).

Barroso et al. (2014) stated that most of the insect's species have a high nutrition value of protein which is similar to the levels of soy meal but lower than fish meal. For example, Diptera has the levels of crude protein range from 40 to 50%, especially *Hermetia illucens* has protein around 36.2 – 37.8 % (Arango Gutiérrez et al., 2004; Sheppard, 2002). Though insect-based protein has several advantages, there is a problematic on the use of protein from insect that contains nitrogen within nacetylglucosamine, a subunit of the chitin polymer, difficult to digest digestibly (Finke et al., 1989). Further, past study also found that the protein content in the insects is generally lower than fish meal but similar to soybean meal. In addition, some insects are also lacks certain amino acid (AA). Insects, *Zonocerus variegatus* and *Macrotermes bellicosus,* are deficiencies in certain AA such as Methionine, Lysine, threonine or tryptophan. Thus, it is suggested that to replace FM should be in combination with other source of protein that may help to prevent the deficiencies caused by the use of a single ingredient and to enhance growth performance (Hansen et al., 2007; Hansen et al., 2011; Zhang et al., 2012a; Zhang et al., 2012b).

Current findings also found that *Oreochromis* sp fed with BSFM in combination with MEM had significantly better growth performance and feed efficiency. This result is similar to past research revealed that replacing fish meal by a mixture of different plant protein sources showed better growth performance in Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* L.) (Al-Thobaiti et al., 2018). Some studies also revealed that the used of soybean meal (Mo et al., 2016), cotton seed meal (Yu et al., 2014), seaweed (*Gracillaria arcuate*) (Al-Asgah et al., 2016) have significant effects on the growth of fish. The FCR and FE both are related to dietary protein intake and can be converted into fish weight gain (Koumi et al., 2009). Present experiment also revealed that there were significant effects on the FCR and FE among the four experimental diets and the commercial diet (Control) which were fed to *Oreochromis* sp. In line with this finding, Radhakrishnan et al. (2016) stated that in the total replacement of FM by *Chlorella vulgaris* had significantly improved the growth and energy utilization of *Macrobrachium rosenbergii*. In addition, the FCR enhanced with an increase in fish weight (Al Hafedh, 1999; Siddiquiaq & Adam, 1981). In addition, De Silva and Anderson (1995) the FCR for fish fed well prepared diets ranges between 1.16 and 1.15. Ogunji and Wirth (2000) revealed that FCR 1.19 indicated the most efficient utilization of feed by Nile tilapia. Other research revealed that FCR highest than 1.5 has been observed (Chou et al., 2001)

In contrast, some research stated that plant-based protein still has antinutritional factors that potentially reduced growth performances and other negatives effects on the fish.Torstensen et al. (2008) found that Specific growth rate of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) was significantly lower in the combined high replacement of FM with plant meal. This reduce of the SGR might be caused by the occurrence of antinutritional (Kumar et al., 2012). Antinutritional from plant can be defined as substances that can interfere with food utilization and affect the health and production in animals (Makkar, 1993).

In consideration with the existence of antinutritional in plant, combination between BSFM and MEM to replace FM is the alternative way to obtain optimum fish growth and feed efficiency. Combination between insect-based protein and plant-based protein is also useful to balance the AA composition (Henry et al., 2015). Nutritional studies have stated that combining superworm meal with 10% of a prebiotic mushroom in a fish diet further enhanced the performances of Growth Rate and FCR of fish (Din et al., 2012) which also due to a balancing of the AA composition of the fish diet (Kim et al., 2009).

CONCLUSION

The replacement of fish meal up to 100% in combination between black soldier fly meal and Manihot esculenta meal is suggested to get better growth performance and feed efficiency in Oreochromis sp. Further research needs to be conducted to determine the effects of replacement for long period to growth performance, immune profiles, and antioxidant enzymes activity.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors are grateful to the following: Mulawarman University, especially Department Biology, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences for all supports. The authors also thanks to Unit Pelaksana Teknis Daerah (UPTD) Balai Benih Sentral Air Tawar Sebulu, Dinas Kelautan dan Perikanan Provinsi Kalimantan Timur for all kinds supports.

REFERENCES

Al-Asgah, N. A., Younis, E.-S. M., Abdel-Warith, A.-W. A., & Shamlol, F. S. (2016). Evaluation of red seaweed *Gracilaria arcuata* as dietary ingredient in African catfish, *Clarias gariepinus. Saudi Journal of Biological Sciences* 23: 205-210.

Al-Thobaiti, A., Al-Ghanim, K., Ahmed, Z., Suliman, E., & Mahboob, S. (2018). Impact of replacing fish meal by a mixture of different plant protein sources on the growth performance in Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* L.) diets. *Brazilian Journal of Biology* 78: 525-534.

Al Hafedh, Y. (1999). Effects of dietary protein on growth and body composition of Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus* L. *Aquaculture Research* 30: 385-393.

Ali, A. E., Mekhamar, M. I., Gadel-Rab, A. G., & Osman, A. G. M. (2015). Evaluation of Growth Performance of Nile Tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus* niloticus Fed *Piophila casei* Maggot Meal (Magmeal) Diets. *American Journal of Life Sciences* 3: 24-29.

Aniebo, A. O., Erondu, E. S., & Owen, O. J. (2018). Replacement of fish meal with maggot meal in African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) diets| Sustitución de harina de pescado con harina de larvas en dietas para el bagre Africano (*Clarias gariepinus*). *UDO Agrícola* 9.

AOAC. (1990). Official Methods of Analysis 15th Ed. *Association of Official Analytical Chemists, Inc Virginia, United State of America*.

Arango Gutiérrez, G. P., Vergara Ruiz, R. A., & Mejía Vélez, H. (2004). Analisis composicional, microbiológico y digestibilidad de la proteína de la harina de larvas de *Hermetia illuscens* L (Diptera: stratiomyiidae) en Angelópolis-Antioquia, Colombia. *Revista Facultad Nacional de Agronomía-Medellín* 57.

Aride, P., Oliveira, A., Oliveira, A., Ferreira, M., Baptista, R., Santos, S., & Pantoja-Lima, J. (2016). Growth and hematological responses of tambaqui fed different amounts of cassava (Manihot esculenta). *Arquivo Brasileiro de Medicina Veterinária e Zootecnia* 68: 1697-1704.

Arisanti, F. D., Arini, E., & Elfitasari, T. (2013). Pengaruh Kepadatan Yang Berbeda Terhadap Kelulushidupan Dan Pertumbuhan Ikan Mas (*Cyprinus Carpio*) Pada Sistem Resirkulasi Dengan Filter Arang. *Journal of Aquaculture Management and Technology* 2(4): 139-144.

Barroso, F. G., de Haro, C., Sánchez-Muros, M.-J., Venegas, E., Martínez-Sánchez, A., & Pérez-Bañón, C. (2014). The potential of various insect species for use as food for fish. *Aquaculture* 422-423: 193-201.

Boyd, C. E. (1998). Water Quality for Pond Aquaculture. *International Center for Aquaculture and Aquatic Environment*.

Busacher, G. P., Adelman, I. R., & Goolish, E. M. (1990). Growth. In: C. B. Schreck and P. B. Moyle (eds.) Methods for Fish Biology. American Fisheries Society, Bethesda, Maryland.

Chou, R.-L., Su, M.-S., & Chen, H.-Y. (2001). Optimal dietary protein and lipid levels for juvenile cobia (*Rachycentron canadum*). *Aquaculture* 193: 81-89.

Craig, S., & Helfrich, L. A. (2002). Understanding Fish Nutrition, Feeds and Feeding. *Virginia Cooperative Extension*.

De Silva, S. S., & Anderson, T. A. (1995). Fish nutrition in aquaculture. Chapman and Hall, London.

Din, A., Razak, S. A., & Sabaratnam, V. (2012). Effect of mushroom supplementation as a prebiotic compound in super worm based diet on growth performance of red tilapia fingerlings. *Sains Malaysiana* 41: 1197-1203.

Effendi, I., Bugri, H. J., & Widanarni. (2006). Pengaruh Padat Penebaran Terhadap Kelangsungan Hidup dan Pertumbuhan Benih Ikan Gurami (*Osphronemus gouramy)* Lac. Ukuran 2 Cm. *Jurnal Akuakultur Indonesia* Vol. 5(2): 127-135.

Finke, M. D., DeFoliart, G. R., & Benevenga, N. J. (1989). Use of a four-parameter logistic model to evaluate the quality of the protein from three insect species when fed to rats. *The Journal of nutrition* 119: 864-871.

Fitzsimmons, K. (2016). Supply and Demand in Global Tilapia Market 2015 World Aquaculture Society, Las Vegas.

Gasco, L., Belforti, M., Rotolo, L., Lussiana, C., Parisi, G., Terova, G., Roncarati, A., & Gai, F. (2014). Mealworm (*Tenebrio molitor*) as a potential ingredient in practical diets for rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). In: Insects to Feed The World, The Netherlands. p 78.

Gatlin III, D. M., Barrows, F. T., Brown, P., Dabrowski, K., Gaylord, T. G., Hardy, R. W., Herman, E., Hu, G., Krogdahl, Å., & Nelson, R. (2007). Expanding the utilization of sustainable plant products in aquafeeds: a review. *Aquaculture research* 38: 551-579.

Hanief, M. A. R., Subandiyono, & Pinandoyo. (2014). Pengaruh Frekuensi Pemberian Pakan Terhadap Pertumbuhan Dan Kelulushidupan Benih Tawes (*Puntius javanicus*). *Journal of Aquaculture Management and Technology* 3: 67-74.

Hansen, A.-C., Rosenlund, G., Karlsen, Ø., Koppe, W., & Hemre, G.-I. (2007). Total replacement of fish meal with plant proteins in diets for Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua* L.) I—Effects on growth and protein retention. *Aquaculture* 272: 599-611.

Hansen, J. Ø., Shearer, K. D., Øverland, M., Penn, M. H., Krogdahl, Å., Mydland, L. T., & Storebakken, T. (2011). Replacement of LT fish meal with a mixture of partially deshelled krill meal and pea protein concentrates in diets for Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*). *Aquaculture* 315: 275-282.

Henry, M., Gasco, L., Piccolo, G., & Fountoulaki, E. (2015). Review on the use of insects in the diet of farmed fish: Past and future. *Animal Feed Science and Technology* 203: 1-22.

Hu, J., Wang, G., Huang, Y., Sun, Y., He, F., Zhao, H., & Li, N. (2017). Effects of Substitution of Fish Meal with Black Soldier Fly (*Hermetia illucens*)

Article in Press

Larvae Meal, in Yellow Catfish (*Pelteobagrus fulvidraco*) Diets. *The Israeli Journal of Aquaculture* 69: 1-9.

Iskandar, R. d. E. (2015). Pertumbuhan dan Efisiensi Pakan Ikan Nila (*Oreochromis niloticus*) yang Diberi Pakan Buatan Berbasis Kiambang. Vol. 40 No. 1.

Kaushik, S., & Troell, M. (2010). Taking the fish-in fish-out ratio a step further. *Aquaculture* 35.

Khosravi, S., Jang J.W., Rahimnejad, S., Song J.W., & Jun Lee, K. (2015). Choline Essentiality and Its Requirement in Diets for Juvenile Parrot Fish (*Oplegnathus fasciatus*). *Asian Australasian Journal of Animal Sciences* 28 No. 5: 647-653.

Kim, M. Y., Lee, S. J., Ahn, J. K., Kim, E. H., Kim, M. J., Kim, S.-L., Moon, H. I., Ro, H. M., Kang, E. Y., & Seo, S. H. (2009). Comparison of free amino acid, carbohydrates concentrations in Korean edible and medicinal mushrooms. *Food Chemistry* 113: 386-393.

Kordi, M. G. H. (2010). Panduan Lengkap Memelihara Ikan Air Tawar di Kolam Terpal Ed. 1. *Andi Offset, Yogyakarta*.

Koumi, A. R., Atse, B. C., & Kouame, L. P. (2009). Utilization of soya protein as an alternative protein source in *Oreochromis niloticus* diet: Growth performance, feed utilization, proximate composition and organoleptic characteristics. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 8.

Kumar, V., Barman, D., Kumar, K., Kumar, V., Mandal, S. C., & De Clercq, E. (2012). Antinutritional factors in plant feedstuffs used in aquafeeds. *World Aquaculture* 43: 64.

Li, S., Ji, H., Zhang, B., Zhou, J., & Yu, H. (2017). Defatted black soldier fly (Hermetia illucens) larvae meal in diets for juvenile Jian carp (Cyprinus carpio var. Jian): Growth performance, antioxidant enzyme activities, digestive enzyme activities, intestine and hepatopancreas histological structure. *Aquaculture* 477: 62-70.

Magalhães, R., Sánchez-López, A., Leal, R. S., Martínez-Llorens, S., Oliva-Teles, A., & Peres, H. (2017). Black soldier fly (*Hermetia illucens*) prepupae meal as a fish meal replacement in diets for European seabass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). *Aquaculture* 476: 79-85.

Makkar, H. (1993). Antinutritional factors in foods for livestock. *BSAP Occasional Publication* 16: 69-85.

Metian, A. G. T. M. (2009). Fishing for feed or fishing for food: increasing global competition for small pelagic forage fish. *AMBIO: a Journal of the Human Environment* 38: 294-302.

Mo, W., Lau, R., Kwok, A., & Wong, M. (2016). Use of soybean meal and papain to partially replace animal protein for culturing three marine fish species: Fish growth and water quality. *Environmental pollution* 219: 815-820.

Moradi, N., Imanpoor, M., & Taghizadeh, V. (2013). Hematological and biochemical changes induced by replacing fish meal with plant protein in the *Cyprinus carpio* Linnaeus (1785). *Global Veterinaria* 11: 233-237.

Muchlisin, Z. A., Afrido, F., Murda, T., Fadli, N., Muhammadar, A. A., Jalil, Z., & Yulvizar, C. (2016). The effectiveness of experimental diet with varying levels of papain on the growth performance, survival rate and feed utilization of keureling fish (*Tor tambra*). *Biosaintifika: Journal of Biology & Biology Education* 8: 172-177.

Ng, W. K., Liew, F. L., Ang, L. P., & Wong, K. W. (2001). Potential of mealworm (Tenebrio molitor) as an alternative protein source in practical diets for African catfish, Clarias gariepinus. *Aquaculture Research* 32: 273-280.

Nugroho, R. A., & Nur, F. M. (2018). Insect-based protein: future promising protein source for fish cultured. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 144: 012002.

Nur, F. M., Nugroho, R. A., & Fachmy, S. (2017). Effects of propolis (*Trigona* sp.) extract supplementation on the growth and blood profile of *Pangasius djambal*. In: AIP Conference Proceedings. p 020024.

Odo, G. E., Agwu, J. E., Nweze, N. O., Clement, S., Alfreda, N. O., Onyishi, G., Uche, N., Ajuziogu, G., Ikegbunam, C., & Nelson, O. I. (2016). Growth performance and nutrient utilization of *Clarias gariepinus* fed with different dietary levels of processed cassava leaves. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 15: 1184-1192.

Ogunji, J. O., & Wirth, M. (2000). Effect of dietary protein content on growth, food conversion and body composition of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings, fed fish meal diet. *Journal of Aquaculture in the Tropics* 15: 381–389.

Radhakrishnan, S., Belal, I. E., Seenivasan, C., Muralisankar, T., & Bhavan, P. S. (2016). Impact of fishmeal replacement with *Arthrospira platensis* on growth performance, body composition and digestive enzyme activities of the freshwater prawn, *Macrobrachium rosenbergii*. *Aquaculture reports* 3: 35-44.

Roncarati, A., Gasco, L., Parisi, G., & Terova, G. (2014a). Growth performance of common catfish (*Ameiurus melas* Raf.) fingerlings fed insect meal diets. In: 1st International Conference "Insects to Feed the World. p 162.

Roncarati, A., Mordenti, O., Stocchi, L., & Melotti, P. (2014b). Comparison of growth performance of common catfish *Ameiurus melas*, Rafinesque 1820, reared in pond and in recirculating aquaculture system. *Journal of Aquaculture Research & Development* 2014.

Sang, H. M., Fotedar, R., & Filer, K. (2011). Effects of Dietary Mannan Oligosaccharide on Survival, Growth, Physiological Condition, and Immunological Responses of Marron, *Cherax tenuimanus* (Smith 1912). *Journal of the World Aquaculture Society* 42: 230-241.

Setiawati, M., Sutaja, R., dan Suprayudi, M.A. (2008). Effect of Different Protein and Protein Energy Ratio in Diet on Growth of Common Carp (*Cyprinus carpio*) Fingerling. *Akuakultur Indonesia* 7(2): 171-178.

Sheppard, C. (2002). Black soldier fly and others for value-added manure management. University of Georgia, Tifton GA 31794 USA.

Siddiquiaq, H. S., & Adam, A. A. (1988). Effects of dietary protein levels on growth, diet conversion and protein utilization in fry and young Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus. Aquaculture* 70: 63-73.

SNI. (2015). Pembesaran Ikan Mas (*Cyprinus carpio*) dalam Karamba Jaring Apung di Sungai. *SNI 8123*.

Sumiati, Hermana, W., & Afiati, A. (2006). Suplementasi Kolin Klorida dalam Ransum untuk Meningkatkan Pertumbuhan Ayam Broiler. *Departemen Ilmu Nutrisi dan Teknologi Pakan Fakultas Peternakan IPB* Vol. 29 No. 1: 16-19.

Syahrizal, S., Ghofur, M., & Fakhrurrozi, F. (2017). Pemanfaatan daun singkong (*Manihot utilissima*) tua sebagai pakan ikan gurami (*Osphronemus gouramy*. Lac). *Jurnal Ilmiah Universitas Batanghari Jambi* 13: 107-112.

Tang, L., Wang, G.X., Jiang, J.,, Feng, L., Yang, L.,, Li, S. H., Kuang, S. Y., & Zhou, X. Q. (2009). Effect of Methionine on Intestinal Enzymes Activities, Microflora and Humoral Immune of Juvenile Jian carp (*Cyprinus carpio* var. Jian). *Aquaculture Nutrition* 15.

Torstensen, B. E., Espe, M., Sanden, M., Stubhaug, I., Waagbø, R., Hemre, G. I., Fontanillas, R., Nordgarden, U., Hevrøy, E. M., Olsvik, P., & Berntssen, M. H. G. (2008). Novel production of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar)* protein based on combined replacement of fish meal and fish oil with plant meal and vegetable oil blends. *Aquaculture* 285: 193-200.

Wang, Y. (2007). Effect of probiotics on growth performance and digestive enzyme activity of the shrimp *Penaeus vannamei. Aquaculture* 269: 259-264.

Yu, D., Gong, S., Lin, Y., & Yuan, Y. (2014). Partial replacement of fish meal by several plant proteins with or without iron and lysine supplement in diets for juvenile Chinese sucker, *Myxocyprinus asiaticus. Aquaculture Nutrition* 20: 205-212.

Yusup, C. H. M., & Nugroho, R. A. (2017). Effects of copra (*Cocos nucifera*) meal on the growth performance of Cyprinus carpio. In: AIP Conference Proceedings. p 020025.

Zhang, Y., Øverland, M., Shearer, K. D., Sørensen, M., Mydland, L. T., & Storebakken, T. (2012a). Optimizing plant protein combinations in fish meal-free diets for rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) by a mixture model. *Aquaculture* 360: 25-36.

Zhang, Y., Øverland, M., Xie, S., Dong, Z., Lv, Z., Xu, J., & Storebakken, T. (2012b). Mixtures of lupin and pea protein concentrates can efficiently replace high-quality fish meal in extruded diets for juvenile black sea bream (*Acanthopagrus schlegeli*). *Aquaculture* 354: 68-74.

JURNAL

ORIGINALITY REPORT

9%	9%	0%	0%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	article.sciencepublishinggroup.com Internet Source	4%
2	espace.curtin.edu.au Internet Source	4%

Exclude quotes	Off	Exclude matches	< 3%
Exclude bibliography	On		